



Reforming the World Bank:

Will the Gender Strategy
Make a Difference?

A Study With China Case Examples

Elaine Zuckerman and
Wu Qing

The Heinrich Böll Foundation
1638 R Street, NW
Suite 120
Washington, DC 20009, USA
Tel.: +1 (202) 462-7512
Fax: +1 (202) 462-5230
Email: info@boell.org
www.boell.org

 HEINRICH
BÖLL
FOUNDATION





HEINRICH
BÖLL
FOUNDATION

GenderAction



Reforming the World Bank: Will the Gender Strategy Make a Difference?

A Study With China Case Examples

Elaine Zuckerman, President, Gender Action
with

Wu Qing, President, China Women's Health
Network

and inputs by

Aida Orgocka, Jean Poe, and Hilary Sims Feldstein

Heinrich Böll Foundation
Updated Version, 2005

The Heinrich Böll Foundation is affiliated with the German political party of Alliance 90/The Greens. Since 1998, the Böll Foundation has an office in Washington, DC. The Washington office focuses its work on the issues of global governance, sustainable development, social equity and gender democracy.

Director: Helga Flores Trejo

Heinrich Böll Foundation
1638 R Street, NW, Suite 120
Washington, DC 20009
Tel. +1-202-462-7512
Fax +1-202-462-5230
Email: info@boell.org
<http://www.boell.org>

Gender Action, established in 2002, is a nonprofit global advocacy campaign dedicated to ensuring the International Financial Institutions (IFIs) promote women's rights and gender equality.

President: Elaine Zuckerman

Gender Action
1443 S Street, NW, Unit 2
Washington, DC 20009
Tel: +1-202-234-7722
Email: elainez@genderaction.org
<http://www.genderaction.org>

China Women's Health Network, established in 1996 in Beijing, China, provides hotline counseling and free legal services to battered and other disadvantaged women. CWHN also trains trainers in community building to make communities a safer place for women and children.

President: Wu Qing

China Women's Health Network
No. 11 Zhang Jing Hutong, Tong Cheng District
100007 Beijing, China
Tel: +86-(0)10-840-39-347

*Edited by **Liane Schalatek**, Heinrich Böll Foundation.
Questions or comments? Please contact liane@boell.org*

The views expressed in this publication are those of the authors alone. They do not necessarily reflect the views of the Heinrich Böll Foundation.

*© by the authors & the Heinrich Böll Foundation, August 2005; 2nd updated edition.
All rights reserved.*

Acknowledgements

For the second printing, many thanks again to Liane Schalatek, Associate Director of the Heinrich Böll Foundation North America Office, for conceiving and suggesting that Gender Action undertake this project. The project was a perfect fit for Gender Action, a nonprofit advocacy organization dedicated to reforming global financial institutions and ensuring they promote women's rights and gender equality.

Valuable contributions to the first and second printings include inputs from: Liane Schalatek and Carolyn Long, consultant to Women's EDGE, for overall comments; Jean Poe and Aida Orgacka for excellent gender analyses of the World Bank China lending portfolio; Hilary Sims Feldstein for deep gender analyses of World Bank webpages; Suzanne Kindervatter for an update on the World Bank External Gender Consultative Group activities; Jane Madden and Karen Mason of the World Bank for insider insights; and Bruce Rich, Director of International Programs at Environmental Defense, for a keen outsider critique.

Elaine Zuckerman
President
Gender Action

Wu Qing
President
China Women's Health Network

Acronyms

AFR	Africa
AWID	Association for Women’s Rights in Development
BP	Bank Procedure
CAS	Country Assistance Strategy
CESI	Community Empowerment and Social Inclusion Program
CGA	Country Gender Assessment
CGR	Country Gender Review (another name for a CGA)
ECA	Eastern Europe and Central Asia
EAP	East Asia and Pacific
EGCG	External Gender Consultative Group
ESSD	Environmentally & Socially Sustainable Development
ESW	Economic and Sector Work
FSN	Financial Sector Network
GAD	Gender and Development
HIPC	Highly Indebted Poor Country
HD	Human Development
HDN	Human Development Network
IDA	International Development Association
IMF	International Monetary Fund
JSA	Joint Staff Assessment
LAC	Latin America and the Caribbean
MDG	Millennium Development Goal
MENA	Middle East and North Africa
OED	Operations Evaluation Department
OP	Operational Policy
PAD	Project Appraisal Document
PRR	Policy Research Report
PRSP	Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper
PSD	Private Sector Development
PSI	Private Sector and Infrastructure
PREM	Poverty Reduction and Economic Management
PRMGE	Poverty Reduction and Economic Management Network Gender and Development Unit (also called the “gender unit” and the “gender anchor”)
QAG	Quality Assurance Group
QEA	Quality at Entry
QESW	Quality of Economic and Sector Work
QSA	Quality of Supervision
SAR	South Asia Region
SAR	Staff Appraisal Report
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
WBI	World Bank Institute
WEWB	Women’s Eyes on the World Bank
WID	Women in Development

Table of Contents

Foreword	VII
Executive Summary	1
1. Introduction	5
2. Background	9
2.1 History	9
2.2 Extent of Gender Expertise in the Bank	11
2.3 Summary Strategy Content	12
3. How Effective has the Gender Strategy Been to Date?	13
3.1 Interviews	14
3.2 Operations	15
4. Progress Achieved in Meeting Stated Recommended Actions and Target Dates	19
4.1 Year One Strategy Targets	20
4.1.1 Adequate Staff Resources Available	20
4.1.2 Incentive Funding	22
4.1.3 New Operational Policy and Bank Procedures Statements on Gender and Development	23
4.1.4 Incorporating Gender Dimensions into Other Operational Policies	24
4.1.5 Mainstreaming Gender into Joint Staff Assessments (JSAs), Country Assistance Strategies (CASs), Quality Assurance Group (QAG) Assessments	24
4.1.5.1 Joint Staff Assessments (JSAs)	24
4.1.5.2 Country Assistance Strategies (CASs)	25
4.1.5.3 Quality Assurance Group (QAG)	26
4.1.6 New Gender Monitoring and Evaluation System	27
4.2 Ongoing Strategy Targets	27
4.2.1 Mainstreaming Gender into Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers (PRSPs)	27
4.2.2 Integrating Gender into World Bank Institute Courses.....	30
4.2.3 Creating a Series of Technical Modules for Training Staff and Clients on Gender Issues	30
4.2.4 Developing Informal Learning Events	31
4.2.5 A Template/Adaptable Tool	32
4.2.6 A Database on Where to Acquire Gender Expertise	32

4.2.7	Enhancing Engendering Tools on the Bank Website	32
4.2.8	Enhancing and Continuing Collaboration with Civil Society, Other Donors, and the UN System	35
4.2.8.1	<i>Civil Society</i>	35
4.2.8.2	<i>Other Donors and the UN System</i>	36
4.3	Longer Term Targets – Foundations Laid and Progress Achieved	36
4.3.1	Preparing Country Gender Assessments (CGAs)	36
5	Other Initiatives Advancing the World Bank Gender Strategy ...	39
5.1	<i>Gender Anchor Initiatives</i>	39
5.2	<i>GENFUND</i>	40
5.3	<i>Some Regional Initiatives</i>	41
6	Conclusions and Recommendations	42
	References	47
	Annexes	50
	The Authors	61

Boxes and Tables

Box 1	Methodology	8
Table 1	Summary Gender Analysis of World Bank Projects in China, 2000-2005	17
Table 2	Bank Website Gender Pages	34

Annexes

Annex 1:	Persons Interviewed	50
Annex 2:	Interview Questions for World Bank Gender-Expert Staff	51
Annex 3:	Interview Questions for World Bank Non Gender-Experts	52
Annex 4:	Good Practice Examples of World Bank Gender and Macroeconomic Research	53
Annex 5:	Select Gender Indicators	54
Annex 6:	World Bank Internet Websites on Gender	55

Foreword

For many years, international research, including the work of international organizations like the World Bank and several United Nations agencies, has pointed out how promoting and encouraging equality between men and women improves the economic viability of poor countries, reduces poverty and encourages good governance. The 2000 UN Millennium Summit and the resulting campaign to reach a set of eight Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) by 2015 likewise acknowledged the centrality of gender equality in a global campaign to combat poverty. This year in September, a large number of heads of state will assess progress achieved toward these goals and chart the political course for national governments and international institutions to fulfill the promise of freedom from want and fear for the people of the world. Gender equality will rank as one of the most important prerequisites to achieve this aim. The World Bank, the international development organization which claims poverty alleviation as its core mission, plays a significant role in the global efforts to achieve the MDGs, both through monitoring as well as the support of developing country governments policies and projects. Gender-equality efforts, mandatory and non-negotiable, thus need to be central to its programs and projects.

However, up to the most recent past, the World Bank's consideration of gender focused mainly on the Bank's social-reform programs, with a strong focus on health and child care as well as education as distinctive women's issues. Macro-economic policy focusing on economic development such as investment and public sector programs did not figure prominently in the Bank's gender-equality efforts, and the potential roles these programs, projects and policies could play in fostering wider social-economic opportunities for women were not evaluated.

The World Bank Gender Mainstreaming Strategy, introduced in early 2002, is supposed to change the Bank's consideration of gender wholeheartedly, doing away with the notion that a World Bank investment decision, a bank infrastructure project or a World Bank loan program with policy conditionalities is seemingly gender-neutral. While many observers and analysts praised the Gender Mainstreaming Strategy initially after its publication, its adaptation was but an important first step forward. The Strategy's real worth can be measured by the extent to which it is implemented and understood as core mandate by Bank staff. Does it succeed in promoting gender awareness and gender-equality by highlighting and ultimately removing gender-related barriers to poverty reduction and economic development?

The challenge for the World Bank is mainly, but not exclusively internal (some client countries do oppose gender mainstreaming mandates). While social scientists and economists at the Bank have produced plenty of gender disaggregated data and studies that many women's advocate groups and development organizations use widely, the World Bank's main lending

policies rarely take into account the work of its own social development branch. The Gender Mainstreaming Strategy, if implemented to the last letter, should rectify this. But can it really change the ingrained lending culture of the Bank and the mind-sets of its lending officers?

Shortly after the World Bank's adaptation of its Gender Mainstreaming Strategy, the Heinrich Böll Foundation North America asked the international NGO Gender Action to take a closer look at how the World Bank is faring in implementing it. We wanted to know: What has been achieved to date? What are some of the successes and shortcomings of the Strategy put to work? What is the outlook for some of the medium- to long-term goals the Gender Mainstreaming Strategy outlines? Will the Strategy remove a "gender-neutral" bias displayed by the majority of the World Bank's economists and macroeconomic programs? The resulting first study, published in 2003, highlighted some achievements, but also described systemic and chronic shortcomings preventing the full implementation of the Strategy. Almost two years later, these same questions are still, if not more so, valid. Thus, we are very pleased to present here an updated version of the original study, which takes into account new developments in the World Bank.

Our thanks go to the authors, Elaine Zuckerman and Wu Qing with the support of Aida Orgocka, Jean Poe, and Hilary Sims Feldstein, for their excellent and diligent effort in reviewing and updating their initial work. This brochure provides a comprehensive look at the World Bank's Gender Mainstreaming Strategy and the Bank's efforts over the last four years of putting it to work. We hope that it can contribute to focus attention on the importance of gender awareness at the international financial institutions and in macroeconomic policy-making, particularly in times when the majority of world leaders lauds the centrality of gender equality for spurring economic development and combating poverty. Studies such as the one presented here hold the political leaders and the world's development institutions accountable for their promises. Let's make sure that those full-bodied words are not just political rhetoric but are followed by concrete actions.

August 2005

Liane Schalatek
Associate Director
Heinrich Böll Foundation North America
liane@boell.org

Executive Summary

There are several good reasons to promote **engendering – that is ensuring gender considerations are included in** – World Bank investments and other initiatives. The Bank’s own research demonstrates compellingly that greater gender equality translates into greater economic growth and less poverty worldwide. Based on this argument, the Bank’s Gender Strategy, ***“Integrating Gender in the World Bank’s Work: A Strategy for Action”***, promotes the “business” and “poverty reduction” cases for engendering Bank investments and other initiatives. Another critical reason to engender Bank activities is the “human rights” case that women’s rights and gender equality are fundamental for achieving full and equal human rights for all. Despite external pressure by human rights advocates, the Bank overall neglects human rights issues. Another key reason to engender Bank investments is because they are often conditioned on policy reforms fraught with harmful economic, environmental and social, including gender, consequences. Since attempts to close the Bank have shown no sign of succeeding, citizens groups must pressure for Bank reform to ensure all Bank investments and policies are socially and environmentally responsible. As part of a larger Bank reform effort, Gender Action is leading citizen advocacy around making multilateral investments like those of the World Bank promote gender equal development and rights.

This Study assesses the effectiveness of the Bank’s Gender Strategy and recommends how to strengthen the Strategy. It describes how gender advocates inside the Bank have been trying to engender Bank investments and other initiatives over the last 25 years. While some progress has been made, success has been limited. In September 2001, the World Bank Board of Executive Directors endorsed the Gender Strategy that this Study analyzes. The Study examines the Gender Strategy’s strengths, weaknesses and implementation track record. This Study also analyzes the Bank Gender Operational Policy (OP) and an accompanying Bank Procedure (BP) to facilitate policy implementation that the Bank Board also endorsed in 2003.

Much of the Study focused on assessing the extent to which the Bank is implementing and meeting its strategy targets. To determine implementation effectiveness, we interviewed Bank gender experts and a few non-gender experts, and examined a sample of Bank operations and analytical work in China (the Bank’s largest borrower), as well as the Bank gender web pages.

Since creating its first “women in development” (WID) position in January 1977, the Bank has made significant progress in recognizing the necessity to reduce gender gaps. Subsequently, gender experts in the Bank have grown from 1 to some 115. In comparison, the number of Bank environmental experts grew from 1 in the early 1980s to an estimated 700-800 today. Environmental experts constitute roughly 7 percent of Bank staff and consultants compared to gender experts constituting less than 1 percent of Bank staff and consultants. While it is mandatory for Bank staff to analyze the environmental impact of every operation, there are no mandates for gender. Although environment issues are still not addressed satisfactorily, they receive much deeper attention than do gender gaps.

Moreover, a corps of 10-12 centralized gender unit staff plus regional coordinators at Bank headquarters has not expanded since the mid-1980s. The majority of the 115 “gender experts” are country-based “gender focal points”, who add gender part time to other demanding responsibilities. Both headquarters gender staff and the focal points themselves complain that the focal points either lack understanding of gender issues or time to address them or both.

The small corps of full time Bank gender experts is of high quality. Many are sophisticated conveyers of the value derived from addressing gender issues in Bank activities. They do excellent work but their ranks need to expand significantly. Also, the Bank needs complementary incentives and accountability measures for non-gender staff to promote gender equality.

The Bank Gender Strategy centerpiece is the preparation of a Country Gender Assessment (CGA) for each client country. The Strategy is premised on the assumption that CGA priority gender issues will feed into Country Assistance Strategies (CASs) and other analytical and lending instruments. But this sequence might not unfold because a consistent track record demonstrates that Bank staff heed, albeit minimally, mandatory incentives such as the environmental Safeguard Policies and ignore non-mandated policies like that on gender. Staff respond to incentives that are clearly structured to get loans approved by the Board.

Our analysis of a representative sample of Bank analytical work, operations and the CAS in our China case study of the Bank’s largest client indicate that none of these Bank products seriously address gender gaps despite the timely availability of the China Country Gender Review that is supposed to feed into CASs and operations.

Judging Bank publicity alone, one has the impression that the Strategy is known around the Bank. The Gender Director indicated that the Bank had distributed some 8,000 copies of the new Strategy during 2002. Speeches by the Bank President and publicity around gender publications like **Engendering Development** underline the message that gender is important and should be mainstreamed into Bank operations. Contents of B-Span, the World Bank webcasting station on development issues, frequently mainstream gender issues.

But has the message reached Bank staff?

Interviews conducted for this Study suggest that perceptions in the Bank about Gender Strategy effectiveness divide roughly into two camps. On the one hand are the gender experts who work full time promoting gender integration into Bank activities. On the other hand are the vast majority of other staff, most of whom have neither heard of the Strategy nor looked at Bank gender web pages providing tools for engendering investments and other activities. Non-gender experts said they lack the time and incentives to look at the Gender Strategy or web pages. They feel overwhelmed by the proliferating number of Bank strategies numbering around 15 and an ever-growing list of Bank priorities.

The World Bank's mere \$600,000 Incentive Fund for Gender Mainstreaming to facilitate Strategy implementation during fiscal year 2002 alone reflects the low priority gender commands among Bank priorities.

To ensure effective and consistent Gender Strategy implementation, the Strategy needs to be mandated. Although the revised Gender Operational Policy and Bank Procedure improve on the preceding policy, they replicate the unfunded non-mandated nature of the Gender Strategy. As a result, the centerpiece CGAs are likely to be of variable quality and will not be adequately reflected in investments.

Mandates and incentives to ensure that Bank staff promote gender equality and women's rights will contribute to reforming the Bank into a socially and environmentally responsible institution that lives up to its rhetoric to reduce poverty and gender inequalities worldwide. However, the Bank can only achieve these critical goals by transforming its entire framework: It must cancel the debt contracted by undemocratic regimes and abandon economic conditions in Bank loans that impose hardships on poor people, for example, by raising health care and water user fees. Without taking these steps, **not only will gaps between the rich and the poor continue to expand but poverty will continue to feminize** in a world where women already constitute over 70 percent of the poor.

Reforming the World Bank: Will the Gender Strategy Make a Difference?

A Study With China Case Examples

*By Elaine Zuckerman, President, Gender Action, and
Wu Qing, President, China Women's Health Network
with inputs by Aida Orgocka, Jean Poe and Hilary Sims Feldstein*

1. Introduction

There are several good reasons to promote **engendering – that is ensuring gender considerations are included in** – World Bank investments and other initiatives. The Bank's own research demonstrates compellingly that greater gender equality translates into greater economic growth and less poverty worldwide (World Bank 2001a). Because of this argument, the Bank Gender Strategy, "**Integrating Gender in the World Bank's Work: A Strategy for Action**", promotes the "business" and "poverty reduction" cases for engendering Bank investments and other initiatives.

Another critical reason to engender Bank investments and other initiatives is the "human rights" case that women's rights and gender equality are fundamental for achieving full and equal human rights for all. Despite external pressure by human rights advocates, the Bank overall neglects human rights issues. At a recent workshop sponsored by Gender Action and the Heinrich Böll Foundation, a Bank manager asserted he had difficulties responding to Gender Action's rights-based approach "because the Bank does not have a mandate to promote human rights" (Quinones 2004).

Another reason to engender Bank investments is because they are often conditioned on policy reforms fraught with harmful gender, social, economic and environmental consequences. For this reason, some Bank critics wish to end taxpayer-funded Bank investments.¹ But attempts to close the Bank have shown no sign of succeeding. Since the Bank is not closing its doors, citizen groups must pressure for Bank reform to achieve socially and environmentally optimal Bank investments and policy prescriptions. Gender Action was established to lead citizen advocacy around making multilateral investments like the World Bank's promote gender equal development and equal rights for men and women as part of a larger reform effort of the international financial institutions (IFIs).

This paper describes how over the last 25 years, gender advocates in the Bank have been trying to engender Bank investments and other initiatives but their

¹ For example, the 50 Years is Enough Network, <http://www.50years.org>. Bruce Rich describes the genesis of such movements to shut the Bank down in Rich, 1994.

success has been limited. From time to time, they have produced new gender policies, strategies and plans to try to reach a wider Bank audience. In September 2001, the World Bank Board of Executive Directors endorsed the Gender Strategy that this Study analyzes. The Study examines the Gender Strategy's strengths, weaknesses and implementation track record. In 2003, Bank management issued an updated version of the Bank's gender Operational Policy (OP) and an accompanying Bank Procedure (BP) to facilitate policy implementation. This Study also analyzes these operational guidelines.

The updated Study reviews the effectiveness of the Bank's Gender Strategy. The Strategy:

- Systematizes and universalizes targets that, with few exceptions, were initiated prior to the Strategy;
- Contains many one year, medium and longer term targets.

Much of this Study's effort focused on assessing the extent to which Bank is implementing and meeting its Strategy targets. To determine implementation effectiveness, the Study interviewed Bank gender experts and a few non-gender experts, examined a sample of Bank operations and analytical work in China (the Bank's largest borrower), and reviewed Bank gender web pages. The Study's methodology is summarized in Box 1.

The Study first provides a Background section with three subsections as follows:

- History – an historical retrospective on the evolution of gender in the Bank
- Extent of Gender Expertise in the Bank – an analysis of the growth and magnitude of the corps of gender experts in the Bank
- Summary of Strategy Content.

Following this background, the Study presents:

- Findings from interviews with Bank gender experts and non-gender staff
- Results of a gender analysis of operations in the case country – China
- Analysis of progress achieved in meeting Strategy targets through answering the question: "How Effective has the Gender Strategy Been to Date?"

At the time of this second printing, some Bank staff expressed the view that the Bank has recently backslid on gender. During 2004, Bank management almost closed the central gender unit. It was salvaged by internal and external pressure on the Bank President.

It was not possible to conduct the same depth of research on the Bank structure and activities for the second printing as for the first. Because of continuous Bank restructurings, it is impossible for Bank staff, let alone for outsiders, to keep up with the institution's organizational changes. This second printing updated information on the Bank's gender strategy implementation more than on internal

process reforms. We place more emphasis on outcomes than on inputs such as regional gender structures.

As we go to press in the summer of 2005, the Bank has a new controversial President, Paul D. Wolfowitz, who was appointed by the US government without a democratic process. The gender unit has a new Director, Mayra Buvinic, a seasoned gender expert. Her agenda has not yet been formulated but hopefully she will steer the Bank toward staff incentives on gender, and toward mandates needed to push the gender agenda forward in Bank investments rather than merely in studies and rhetoric. The latter are necessary but cannot make a significant difference in contributing to the Bank mission to reduce poverty. Promoting women's empowerment and gender equality through Bank investments is essential. Poverty reduction and women's empowerment, however, can only be achieved if the Bank cancels the debt contracted by undemocratic regimes and abandons economic conditions in Bank loans that impose hardships on poor people, for example, raising health care and water user fees.

Gender Action believes that mandates are essential to ensure all staff become sensitive to and address gender issues in all their work. To date, the Bank has preferred a voluntary approach that does not reward staff for promoting gender equality. Other civil society groups and a member of the Bank's own External Gender Consultative Group have endorsed the need for mandates.² Besides proposing gender mandates, this Study ends with additional conclusions and recommendations.

The current World Bank managerial transition offers an opportunity for the Bank to take these recommendations into account. The new management should consider updating or replacing the current strategy with a new one that contains mandates and commits funding to expand the number of Bank experts who identify and address gender issues and gaps throughout Bank operations. These are the challenges the new Bank managers face in promoting gender equality and reducing poverty. Most critically they must cancel the debt of all countries indebted to the Bank and abandon conditions that undermine poverty reduction. Otherwise not only will gaps between the rich and the poor continue to expand but poverty will continue to feminize in a world where women already constitute over 70 percent of the poor.

² Bruce Jenkins, Policy Director of the Bank Information Center, a civil society group, publicly endorsed Gender Action's proposal for gender mandates at the Heinrich Böll Foundation-sponsored seminar launching the first printing of this publication at the Carnegie Endowment for International Peace in January 2004.

- (1) **Interviews with World Bank Managers and Staff (for the first printing)** *To assess Bank staff perceptions about Strategy strengths and weaknesses and the extent of its dissemination and implementation, we interviewed key Bank gender experts including the Director of the Gender and Development Board, the six regional gender coordinators, and gender advocates working in the World Bank Institute. In addition, to obtain a reality check about awareness of the Gender Strategy, we conducted “spot check” interviews with a few non-gender experts. Annex 1 lists interviewees and Annexes 2 and 3 present the interview questions designed specifically for each group. Non-gender expert interviewees were selected because they were willing to meet, are working in or have worked in “operations” – the Bank’s regional complexes that are responsible for preparing and supervising projects, and are not gender experts. The few interviews conducted were not meant to constitute a scientific sampling but merely to provide an indicative reality check.*
- (2) **Analysis of World Bank Case Study Projects and Country Assistance Strategy (for both first and second printings).** *To obtain a picture of progress made in implementing the Gender Strategy, the Study reviewed the Bank’s lending portfolio and Country Assistance Strategy (CAS) in its largest client country, China (World Bank 2003a). China is the Bank’s largest client in terms of both lending volume and population. Also, the Study selected China because the Bank completed a Country Gender Review (CGR) for China in good time before it prepared the China CAS (World Bank 2002b). The Strategy and the Bank’s Gender and Development Operational Policy and Bank Procedures require that Country Gender Assessments (CGAs) or CGRs feed analysis about country gender issues into CASs (World Bank 2003b & 2003c). Another comparative advantage for reviewing the Bank China portfolio is that both Study authors have deep experience in China. The lead Study author prepared the Bank China CGR, worked as a Bank project economist on China operations, and lived and studied in China. The other author is a native Chinese gender expert who directs several organizations promoting women’s rights and gender equality.*
- (3) **World Bank Website Analysis (for both first and second printings).** *The Study team also analyzed World Bank websites, especially their gender contents.*

In addition, for both printings Gender Action also received comments from Bank Staff and Bank watchers (see Acknowledgements).

2. Background

2.1 History

A historical review reveals that the Bank has made significant progress in *recognizing* the necessity to reduce gender gaps since the concept “Women in Development” (WID) emerged in the early 1970s (Tinker 1990).

Following the 1975 Mexico City First World Conference on Women, the Bank created its first WID position. In January 1977, it hired a veteran WID pioneer and economist as WID Adviser.³ Her challenge was, with meager resources, to sensitize predominantly male Bank staff and borrowers to understand how women affected and were impacted by Bank activities. Her strategies included preparing and sharing sector checklists of questions about women’s roles for project managers. The questions asked how women could contribute to and benefit from projects and how projects impacted them. The Adviser presented these checklists at a series of sector division meetings. Early on, the Adviser learned to frame questions primarily in efficiency terms to reach economist-type Bank staff, although without neglecting equity. She developed training seminars on WID issues for Bank staff that Harvard University delivered. She joined missions to integrate women’s issues into Bank projects and to channel women’s voices into their design. During the first Adviser’s term, the Bank created a policy requiring all projects to include a paragraph about the role of women. The first WID Adviser also presented the Bank WID agenda at interagency meetings. At the 1980 Copenhagen Second World Conference on Women, she presented a paper on behalf of the Bank called, *“Recognizing the Invisible Woman in Development”*.

In 1986, the Bank appointed the second WID Adviser.⁴ She developed an ambitious work plan that she sold to senior management. It required several staff to implement it. Within a few years, the second Adviser became Chief of a WID Unit composed of about a dozen WID specialists. Unit financing came mainly from Bank resources, complemented by bilateral trust funds, especially from the Dutch and Nordic governments. To prioritize resources by sectors, the WID Unit targeted girls’ education, health, agricultural extension, micro-credit, legal and labor issues. The Unit pioneered in-depth country gender assessments for Bangladesh, India, Kenya and Mexico. Unit staff joined Bank missions to integrate WID issues into projects. It reviewed every project Staff Appraisal Report (SAR) for WID analysis.⁵ The Unit generated groundbreaking research demonstrating very high returns to girls’ education and women’s good health. WID issues became mainstreamed into education and health operations. During the second Adviser’s term, each of the then four Bank regions appointed a WID coordinator that promoted WID issues in all regional Bank investments, policies and strategies.

³ Gloria Scott, who was a prominent WID promoter at the United Nations during the preceding decade, was the Bank’s first WID Adviser during 1977-86.

⁴ Barbara Herz, formerly the WID head at USAID and a Bank employee since 1980, filled the Bank WID Adviser and WID Unit Chief position from 1986-93.

⁵ Staff Appraisal Reports are the forerunners of today’s Project Appraisal Documents (PADs) that Bank staff prepare and the Board of Directors must approve for projects to be implemented.

In 1994, a new WID Unit Chief took over.⁶ She replaced Staff Appraisal Report WID reviews with WID monitoring and evaluation of project implementation. Under her leadership, the Bank issued the first version of Operational Policy (OP) 4.20 that promoted reducing gender disparities and increasing women's participation in economic growth. She was part of the Bank team led by President James D. Wolfensohn that participated in the 1995 Beijing Fourth World Conference on Women.

At the Beijing conference, to exert external pressure on the Bank, civil society groups who were exasperated with slow Bank progress in integrating gender issues into Bank investments formed a gender advocacy campaign, Women's Eyes on the World Bank (WEWB). The surviving WEWB Latin America branch is a Gender Action partner that continues Bank gender advocacy work. Gender Action is building on and deepening WEWB efforts to make the multilaterals accountable for gender worldwide. Another WEWB partner organization, Women's EDGE, in 2003 produced an advocacy guide for citizen's groups wanting to better understand where the Bank stands on gender and why gender advocacy is needed (Long 2003). The guide author argued convincingly in an interview that foundations supporting Bank reform around the environment and transparency would be wise to support advocacy groups pressuring the Bank to engender its activities (AWID 2003).

Around the time of the Beijing conference, the Bank replaced the WID approach with a Gender and Development (GAD) approach. Following the Beijing Conference and the 1995 Bank reorganization into a matrix system that marries six regions with five major networks, the WID unit was reincarnated as the Poverty Reduction and Economic Management Network Gender and Development Unit (PRMGE).⁷ It was strategic to locate the gender unit inside the Poverty Reduction and Economic Management (PREM) Network to emphasize the importance of gender roles in poverty reduction and convince influential Bank economists that gender matters for economic growth. PRMGE is informally called the "*gender anchor*". Gender's stature in the Bank was also enhanced by the creation of a Gender and Development Board in 1997 composed of the regional gender coordinators, network and anchor staff. In 1999, the Bank appointed a new Gender Board Chair and PRMGE Director.⁸ During her tenure, the anchor generated several key products to push the Bank gender agenda forward:

- **"Engendering Development: Through Gender Equality in Rights, Resources, and Voice"** (World Bank 2001a). This is the first Bank

⁶ Min Chau headed the WID Unit from 1994-97.

⁷ The Bank's six regions are: Africa (AFR); East Asia and Pacific (EAP); Eastern Europe and Central Asia (ECA); Latin America and the Caribbean (LAC); Middle East and North Africa (MENA); and South Asia (SAR). The Bank's five major thematic networks are: Environmentally and Socially Sustainable Development (ESSD); Financial Sector Network (FSN); Human Development Network (HDN); Poverty Reduction and Economic Management (PREM); and Private Sector and Infrastructure (PSI). In addition, the Bank has a few supporting networks and major complexes, for example, the Operations Evaluation Department (OED) and the World Bank Institute (WBI).

⁸ Karen Mason, formerly of the East-West Center, chaired the Gender and Development Board and headed the gender anchor from 1999-2004.

Policy Research Report (PRR) dedicated to gender issues.⁹ It was co-written with the Bank's research complex. The gender PRR presents compelling correlations worldwide between greater gender equality on the one hand, and greater growth and less poverty on the other. It is a seminal work that synthesizes almost three previous decades of research on WID and gender issues.

- A revised version of Operational Policy 4.20, "**Gender and Development**" and new Bank Procedure 4.20 with the same title (World Bank 2003b; World Bank 2003c). This Study analyzes both of these companion products.
- "**Integrating Gender into the World Bank's Work: A Strategy for Action**", the subject of this Study (World Bank 2002a).¹⁰ The Strategy builds on "Engendering Development" and the evolution of WID and gender integration into international development initiatives. On September 18, 2001, the World Bank Board of Executive Directors endorsed this new Gender Strategy.

As we go to the press with the second printing in the summer of 2005, a new Gender Board Chair and PRMGE Director just took over.¹¹

2.2 Extent of Gender Expertise in the Bank

From the 1977 appointment of the first Bank WID Adviser, gender expert ranks in the Bank have grown from a single person to some 115.¹² In comparison, the number of Bank environmental experts grew from just one in the early 1980s to an estimated 700-800 today. Using a conservative estimate of the total number of Bank staff and consultants of around 15,000, environmental experts constitute roughly 7 percent of Bank staff and consultants. In comparison, the 115 gender experts constitute less than one percent (roughly 0.77 percent) of Bank staff and consultants.

Despite the impressive growth of Bank environmental experts, civil society groups still complain that the Bank inadequately implements its environmental policies. This suggests that numerous experts alone are insufficient but are one of several necessary factors for achieving policy effectiveness. Others are strong managerial endorsement of the primacy of environment or social, including gender, objectives, sensitized and committed staff, strong advocacy policies, widespread and deep dissemination of these policies among staff and incentives to implement them. To live up to its development rhetoric, the Bank must demonstrate that environment and social, including gender, objectives take

⁹ The Policy Research Report is the occasional prestigious flagship Bank research publication.

¹⁰ In the remainder of this report, this strategy is referred to as the "*Gender Strategy*" or simply as the "*Strategy*".

¹¹ Mayra Buvinic, former social sector manager at the Inter-American Development Bank and former President of the International Center for Research on Women.

¹² The gender anchor provided the number of around 115 current Bank gender experts on staff.

precedence over pushing loans and the quality of investments is more important than the quantity (Rich 2002).

Of the some 115 Bank gender experts, the core of only 10-12 central gender unit staff plus a gender coordinator, with a small staff, in each of the six Bank regions, has not expanded since the mid-1980s. Sadly, the majority of the 115 are country-based “gender focal points” or “gender coordinators”, who add gender to their other busy responsibilities. They can only devote part time to gender. Both Bank gender coordinators and the focal points themselves complain that the focal points either lack understanding of gender issues or time to address them or both. To attempt to remedy this, some country gender coordinators in five of the Bank’s six regions have attended gender training workshops in the last two years. It is premature to assess the training impact on their work.

The current institutional placement of gender experts in the Bank appears to be well conceived but is inadequate. The placement is well adapted to the Bank regions. However, it does not respond adequately to the Bank networks. For example, the Financial Sector and Infrastructure networks are virtually devoid of gender experts. In some regions, ESSD or PREM lack gender expertise. The Human Development Network (HD) intrinsically addresses gender because education and health mainstream gender better than other sectors do. More details about the institutional placement and quality of Bank gender experts are provided in the section below, “Adequate Staff Resources Available”, which analyzes Strategy targets.

The small corps of full-time Bank gender experts, excluding many of the part-time gender focal points, tends to be of high quality. Many are sophisticated conveyers of the added value of addressing gender in Bank activities. They do excellent work but their ranks need to expand significantly. Also, the Bank needs complementary incentives and accountability measures for staff to promote gender equality and women’s rights.

2.3 Summary Strategy Content

The Strategy centerpiece is the preparation of a Country Gender Assessment (CGA) for each Bank client country that would feed into Country Assistance Strategies (CASs) and operations that ensue from CASs.

The Strategy contains three processes:

- “Prepare, for each country in which the Bank has an active lending program, a periodic, Country Gender Assessment analyzing the gender dimensions of development across sectors and identifying the gender-responsive actions that are important for poverty reduction, economic growth, human well-being and development effectiveness, and use it to inform the Bank’s country assistance program;
- Develop and implement, as part of the country assistance program, priority policy and operational interventions that respond to the CGA; and

- Monitor the implementation and results of these policy and operational interventions” (World Bank 2002a).

The Strategy recognizes that this process needs to be country-specific and country-led, with the Bank playing a supportive but pro-active role.

The Strategy itself is process oriented. It suggests that Bank managers and staff embrace new processes. The Strategy is premised on the assumption that with the preparation of CGAs, relevant analytical and lending instruments will address gender issues. But this sequence might not play out because the assumption ignores a consistent record showing that Bank staff responds to mandatory incentives, above all to getting loans approved that minimally meet required Safeguard Policies.¹³ The Bank Safeguard Policies do not include the non-mandated gender policies.¹⁴

3. How Effective Has the Gender Strategy Been to Date?

To examine Gender Strategy effectiveness, this section presents the results of interviews with Bank staff, analyses of Bank operations and impressions from World Bank learning events.

Judging by Bank publicity alone, one has the impression that the Strategy is known around the Bank. The former Gender Director indicated that the Bank had distributed some 8,000 copies of the new Strategy during 2002. Speeches by the Bank President and publicity around gender publications like **“Engendering Development”** provide the impression that the message that gender is important and should be mainstreamed into Bank operations is made repeated frequently and heard. Contents on B-Span, the World Bank webcasting station on development issues, frequently mainstream gender issues.

Despite this massive publicity, has the message reached Bank staff?

¹³ The Bank’s 10 mandated Safeguard Policies address environment, resettlement and indigenous policy issues. The Bank created the mandatory policies in response to incessant external pressure (Rich 1994, 2002). The Bank is piloting and planning to expand a new “Country Systems” approach whereby country laws would supercede Bank Safeguard Policies. In a Bank consultation with civil society groups in January 2005 on the draft, “Issues in Using Country Systems in Bank Operations” , Gender Action demonstrated that the new Country Systems draft was devoid of gender issues. Bank managers promised to remedy this gap. Gender Action’s inputs should have already been provided by the Bank gender anchor, but the anchor is too overstretched to respond such needs.

¹⁴ Although the last PRMGE Director maintained that the Bank gender Operational Policy and Procedure lack the force of mandates, Gender Action is in the process of exploring their potential as mandates.

3.1 Interviews

Interviews, conducted mainly for the first printing, suggest that perceptions in the Bank about Gender Strategy effectiveness divide roughly into two camps. On the one hand is the small corps of gender experts who work full time promoting gender integration into Bank activities. They are familiar with and keen advocates of the Gender Strategy; many of them contributed to creating the Strategy. Also some Bank non-gender experts who are gender advocates are in this camp. Gender anchor staff and most regional gender coordinators interviewed feel their multiple initiatives to sensitize Bank staff and clients to gender have been fairly effective. These initiatives are discussed further in this Study.

Despite the strength of the gender experts, their messages appear to reach too few non-gender experts. This conclusion is based on a spot check about the awareness of gender and the Strategy conducted among non-gender experts who are in the other camp.

Interviews with a handful of non-gender expert Bank staff for the first printing indicate that probably very few non-gender experts have a gender mindset. This conclusion is indicative of spot checks, not a scientific survey because it was based on interviewing only seven Bank non-gender experts (Annex 1). The non-gender experts interviewed were not selected based on whether they might or might not be gender aware. They were selected because they were willing to be interviewed and had experience working on Bank operations. Of the seven non-gender experts asked if they were aware of the Strategy, all but one responded that they had never heard of the Strategy. None of the non-gender experts interviewed had read the Strategy. Asked if they ever looked at any Bank web pages presenting gender content, gender analysis tools, sex-disaggregated data, analytical publications and operational best practices about gender and development, two of the non-gender experts had opened a Bank gender website but only once. When asked if they ever considered the meaning of gender and gender mainstreaming, two answered affirmatively. When asked if they knew who their regional gender coordinator is, only one could name the coordinator. Most were unaware that their regions had gender coordinators. At the time of the second printing, in a chance encounter between the Study's lead author and a Bank regional Lead Social Scientist, the latter stated that he had never heard of his regional gender coordinator. When asked if they had ever attended any gender training, their answers were uniformly negative.

While it would not be scientific to extrapolate alone from such a small number of non-gender experts, other data corroborate that Bank non-gender experts are oblivious overall or are unmotivated to address gender issues in their work. For example, discussions over years by the lead author with Bank staff working across sectors around the world corroborate this conclusion. Moreover, **several regional gender coordinators estimated that probably less than five percent of their regions' economists had glanced at the Strategy.** Also, many Bank economists that the lead author interviewed for previous Bank gender analyses expressed no interest in or time for gender issues (World Bank 2002b; Zuckerman 2000a).

All the non-gender experts interviewed said they lacked the time and incentives to look at the Gender Strategy or gender mainstreaming websites. They all felt overwhelmed by the proliferating number of Bank strategies. The Bank website lists 14 thematic and sector strategies.¹⁵ The non-gender experts' answers underline that they are driven by the Bank lending culture and mandates, not by unfunded non-mandated strategies and policies such as those relating to gender.

In an internal Bank 2003 Quality Assurance Group survey of approximately 400 Task Team Leaders (TTLs), 76% of respondents reported knowing about the Bank's gender mainstreaming strategy.¹⁶ However, this does not mean that they use the strategy.¹⁷

3.2 Operations

Besides conducting interviews, a key approach of this Study was analyzing a sample of Bank operations, since the real test of the Strategy's implementation is the extent to which Bank investments address gender issues. As a case study, we analyzed Bank operations in one Bank client country, China. It made sense to analyze the Bank's China portfolio for several reasons: first, China is by far the largest Bank borrower; second, both Study co-authors are China gender experts; and third, the Bank completed the China Country Gender Review (CGR) in 2000, before the Gender Strategy was launched, providing Bank staff working on China with a deep analysis of major gender gaps in China (World Bank 2002b).¹⁸

China might not seem to be a representative Bank borrower country in at least one way. Since it graduated from obtaining a blend of IDA concessional-IBRD market interest rates to pure IBRD eligibility (i.e. it no longer qualifies for the lowest rate, long-term loans the Bank provides for its poorest borrowing countries), it decided to minimize Bank loans for social sector projects.¹⁹ Thus the China portfolio today is infrastructure weighted. Gender analyses of Bank operations across countries and sectors reveal that gender tends to be better addressed in traditional "women's" sectors – specifically the social sectors, particularly education and health. In contrast, infrastructure, structural adjustment and other large investments tend to neglect gender. However, the China projects reviewed for this analysis are representative of Bank projects generally. First,

¹⁵ The Bank website states that strategies "provide a vision to guide the Bank's future work in a given sector". Strategies are revised every three years, through stakeholder consultations. The following thematic and sector strategies have been published on the World Bank website: [Anti-corruption](#); [Education](#); [Environment](#); [Gender](#); [Governance & Public Sector Reform](#); [Health, Nutrition and Population](#); [HIV/AIDS Strategy for Africa](#); [Mining \(Regional Strategies\)](#); [Private Sector](#); [Rural Development Strategy](#) (draft); [Telecommunications and Informatics](#); [Urban & Local Government](#); [Urban Transport](#) (consultation); [Water Resources Management](#). See www.worldbank.org.

¹⁶ It is unknown what percent of those surveyed responded.

¹⁷ In another study, the lead author questions the value of Quality Assurance Group products for focusing more on Bank internal processes than outcomes (Zuckerman 2001).

¹⁸ This Study's lead author also wrote the China Country Gender Review (World Bank 2002b).

¹⁹ IDA is the Bank lending arm that provides low-interest loans to lower-income developing countries. IBRD is the Bank lending arm that lends at market interest rates to middle income developing countries.

they include the few existing Bank China social sector projects that we deliberately included in our analysis. Second, the infrastructure projects are in sectors such as water and sanitation, transport, the environment and rural development where men and women play distinct gender roles and often have distinct needs.

This Study's gender analysis of Bank projects in China depended on three initiatives: Analyses of 6 of 17 projects the Bank approved for China during 2003-2005; 6 of 24 projects the Bank approved during 2000-2002; and 23 of 97 projects under implementation during 1997-2000.²⁰ The samples selected are representative of the sectors the Bank supports in China.

Results of Gender Action's 2003-2005 and 2000-2002 analyses are presented together in Table 1. We found that, as would be expected, gender was best addressed in the education project, but surprisingly the health sector tuberculosis project did not even disaggregate data by gender. The ten non-social sector projects in our sample covering environment, transportation, power, and agriculture largely neglected gender issues. Several project documents mentioned the importance of women's participation in the consultation process, but with the exception of the education project, none provided any detail on how the projects will be more accountable on gender.²¹ Even when project documents occasionally identified women as beneficiaries, they did not specify how women would participate. None of the project documents referred to the Bank's China Country Gender Review (CGR). Thus, the rural development project documents do not acknowledge the feminization of poverty in China that the CGR discusses (World Bank 2002b). Although the water conservation project recognized women's important sector role, like the other projects sampled, it ignored gender differentiated needs and impacts.

This Study also used the results of the Bank's China Country Gender Review (CGR) gender analysis of a representative sample of 23 out of 97 projects under implementation across sectors during 2000 and all 11 pieces of Bank Economic and Sector Work (ESW is a Bank term for analytical research) on China completed between 1997 and 2000 (World Bank 2002b). A table summarizing this gender analysis can be found in the China CGR that concludes,

“Overall, the Bank portfolio of ESW and projects in China only considers gender to a limited extent... Most of the other Bank analyses and projects reviewed miss opportunities to consider the gender implications of important issues like poverty reduction, resettlement and labor market shifts such as migration and state-owned-enterprise (SOE) restructuring. Addressing the gender-differentiated effects of these Bank-supported interventions would contribute to reducing poverty.”

²⁰ Aida Orgocka and Jean Poe analyzed Bank Project Appraisal Documents (PADs) for the 2000-02 and 2003-05 projects respectively. PADs are the final project documents that the Bank Board of Directors approves. Earlier projects were analyzed for the China Country Gender Review (World Bank 2002b).

²¹ Civil society groups often complain that their consultation inputs have been ignored during Bank project implementation.

Table 1: Summary Gender Analysis of World Bank Projects in China, 2000 - 2005²²

<u>Project</u>	<u>Year Approved</u>	<u>Gender Analysis</u>
Tai Basin Urban Environmental Project	Environment 2005	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Does not differentiate between men and women for persons affected by the project. • The retroactive review undertaken for related resettlement activities does not make gender differentiations in the affected people. • Consultations with affected communities do include interviews with men and women.
Hubei Shiman Highway Project	Transport 2004	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The participation strategy neglects the different effects on males and females, and views farmer groups generically. • Contains no gender analysis of the economic inequality in the affected low-income areas. • A social assessment conducted by the Social Investigation and Research Institute of Beijing University mentions that it paid particular attention to women and other vulnerable groups to ensure that they participate and benefit from the project, but there was neither mention of interviews conducted with women nor a gender analysis of the projects impacts.
Basic Education Project in Western Areas	Education 2004	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Includes gender as one of the principle themes of the project. • Promotes decrease in the gender gap in primary and junior secondary education enrollment. • Project promises to look at ways to improve girls education, and will emphasize the training of women teachers. • Does not provide a statistical analysis of the enrollment numbers of girls versus boys in each of the project districts.
Gansu and Xinjiang Pastoral Development Project	Agriculture 2004	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Mentions monitoring the gender differentiated impact of the project, but neglects gender disaggregated impacts of farmers/herders. • The project is consistent with Country Assistance Strategy (CAS) goals, but contains no mention of consistency with the CGR. • Recognizes importance of women's participation, and assures the inclusion of strategies for women's participation in Beneficiaries Participation Manuals and the Minority Ethnic Groups Plans.
Anhui Provincial Highway II	Transport 2003	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • There are no gender recommendations, and women are not mentioned as beneficiaries or part of the target population of the project. • Women were not included as part of the social assessment, and gender was not considered as part of the poverty reduction intervention. • Contains no gender recommendations even for the resettlement component.

²² Gender Action volunteer Aida Orgocka analyzed the 2000-2002 and intern Jean Poe the 2003-2005 projects.

Yixing Pumped Storage Project	Power 2003	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Neglects to consider gendered needs and impacts in social assessment and sustainability analysis. • Mentions the participation of women in evaluation meetings and consultation sessions, but fails to provide sex disaggregated data anywhere including the resettlement plans, land ownership, and employment possibilities in the resettlement area.
Tuberculosis Control Project	Health 2002	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Focuses on the poor but makes no effort to disaggregate data by gender. • Does not address female-specific vulnerability and risks. • Does not state how women will benefit from project outcomes. • Mentions a women's NGO might be a project stakeholder without explaining why or how it would be involved.
National Railway Project	Transport 2002	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Provides no gender analysis of project impacts especially important in land appropriation from owners. • Made no effort to interview women and men impacted by the project.
Third Inland Waterways Project	Water 2001	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Contains no gender analysis of social impacts including resettlement and land lost by inundation although the project aims to indirectly reduce poverty and improve lives of families and especially children. • States local people affected were consulted, but no separate consultations for women and men nor any gender issue focus.
Urumqi Urban Transport Improvement Project	Transport 2000	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Neglects to consider gendered needs and impacts in analyses of present and proposed improved transport system. • Discusses resettlement strategies without indicating male and female needs and impacts.
Second Beijing Environment Project	Environment 2000	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Contains no discussion of gender disaggregated impacts of project to improve wastewater, air quality and other environmental systems. • Neglected to consult men and women separately or explore their differentiated needs during the public hearings.
Water Conservation Project	Water 2000	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Recognizes women's important role in farm irrigation management. • Neglects the different effects on males and females in a project survey of impacted communities that presented the view of "farmers" generically.

This Study also used the results of the Bank's China Country Gender Review (CGR) gender analysis of a representative sample of 23 out of 97 projects under implementation across sectors during 2000 and all 11 pieces of Bank Economic and Sector Work (ESW is a Bank term for analytical research) on China completed between 1997 and 2000 (World Bank 2002b). A table summarizing this gender analysis can be found in the China CGR that concludes,

"Overall, the Bank portfolio of ESW and projects in China only considers gender to a limited extent... Most of the other Bank analyses and projects reviewed miss opportunities to consider the gender implications of important issues like poverty reduction, resettlement and labor market shifts such as migration and state-owned-enterprise (SOE) restructuring.

Addressing the gender-differentiated effects of these Bank-supported interventions would contribute to reducing poverty.”

Another remarkable CGR finding was that the many detailed Bank rural poverty analyses neither acknowledged the well documented feminization of poverty and agriculture in China nor China’s record of having the world’s highest female suicide rate and one of the most rapidly proliferating patterns of trafficking in women and girls. Both China’s female suicide and trafficking victims are concentrated heavily among poor young rural females (World Bank 2002b).

The analyses in Table 1 and in the China CGR suggest that progress in engendering Bank projects in China has not occurred since the CGR was made available since 2000. Moreover, this Study’s assessment below of the extent to which China’s CAS incorporates CGR findings demonstrates that the China CAS neglected incorporating CGR findings and recommendations although the CGR-CAS flow of information constitutes the heart of the Strategy process.

Our conclusion that the World Bank China portfolio hardly pays attention to, let alone tries to redress, gender gaps is strongly corroborated by recent Gender Action analyses of Bank investments in other countries. One important example is Gender Action’s analysis of the gendered impacts of structural adjustment loans (SALs) in Serbia and Montenegro where SALs composed over four fifths of Bank loans at the time of our analysis (Vladisavljevic and Zuckerman 2004). Serbia and Montenegro’s structural adjustment objectives mirror those in virtually all countries. They consist of public expenditure cutbacks and civil service reforms including in the social sectors – in health, education, labor and social protection programs; State Owned Enterprise (SOE) closing, restructuring and/or privatizing; and bank commercialization and downsizing. We found a distinct pattern of SAL neglect of gendered impacts.

4. Progress Achieved in Meeting Stated Recommended Actions and Target Dates

This section analyzes the track record of virtually all, about 20, Gender Strategy priority targets.

In the text and in tables, the Strategy presents a series of actions with target dates to achieve gender mainstreaming. An implementation timetable contains three columns: strategy elements, recommended actions, and target dates (World Bank 2002a Table 2.2). Target dates are roughly divided into one year, ongoing and longer term. Some target dates could be switched from one timeframe to another but this is not a significant issue. More important issues are the extent to which these targets are implementable and likely to have a meaningful impact in moving the gender and Bank reform agenda forward, and what is missing in these targets in order for the Strategy to achieve its goals. This section of the Study analyzes the implementation status of most proposed Strategy actions against their target dates.

Gender anchor staff underlined that few of the recommended actions are new Bank activities. Virtually all of them were initiated prior to the Strategy, some of them years ago (see the History section above). However, the Strategy systematizes and universalizes these actions across countries.

Of the many Strategy targets, Country Gender Assessments (CGAs) stand out as the most central element. But Gender Action believes that the Strategy overall and its recommended CGA in particular need to be mandated to move beyond only inconsistent and occasional follow up. Only when gender and other Bank poverty-reducing social objectives are mandated will effective implementation become possible.

4.1 Year One Strategy Targets

4.1.1 Adequate Staff Resources Available

As the “Extent of Gender Expertise in the Bank” section above reported, gender experts compose less than one percent of Bank staff and consultants. The majority of these “experts” are actually country-based gender focal points who often lack gender expertise and devote only part time, sometimes only 10-15 percent of their time, to integrating gender into Bank products. The ranks of genuine gender experts and the gender expertise of focal points needs to be augmented.

The current institutional placement of the small ranks of gender experts in the Bank’s headquarters was organized prior to the articulation of the Strategy. It appears to be well conceived and adapted to the Bank’s matrix organization that marries six regions with four major networks. World Bank headquarters in Washington DC house the central gender anchor and Gender Board strategically within the Poverty Reduction and Economic Management Network (PREM). The anchor, with about a dozen gender experts, organizes gender research, training and promotional work in the Bank. Gender experts in the anchor have complementary disciplinary backgrounds including legal, anthropological, sociological and economic expertise. But there are too few gender anchor experts.

Some networks have weak gender capacity. Parts of Environmentally and Socially Sustainable Development (ESSD) and Poverty Reduction and Economic Management (PREM) have gender expertise, but there are gaps. The Human Development’s (HD) education and health sectors tend to integrate gender issues more than do other sectors. Recently the International Finance Corporation (IFC), the Bank’s main private sector arm, launched a new Private Sector Development Gender-Enterprise-Markets (GEM) program promoting women’s increasing role in the private sector. As is so often the case, a gender advocate on the IFC staff is responsible for this development. The Gender Strategy does not cover the IFC. This Study recommends that the Bank place gender experts strategically in all networks in order to meet the Strategy goal of mainstreaming gender into all Bank activities.

Although each region has at least one regional gender coordinator and most regions have more than one gender expert at headquarters, they lament the inadequate number of gender experts on their regional staffs. The headquarters-based Gender and Development Board brings together gender experts from the Bank regions, networks and anchor to approve new gender policies, strategies and directions.

The regional coordinator system is complemented by Bank Country Office gender focal points. Most gender focal points are civil society officers or other social sector experts who add gender to their other responsibilities. They often don't have a clear mandate.²³ Their quality is very uneven – some are excellent and some are weak. Some focal points, even those with gender expertise, cannot allocate more than 10-15 percent of their time to gender issues. A potentially strong gender focal point complained that only 10 percent of her time is available for gender.²⁴ Only a tiny minority of Country Offices employ dedicated gender experts while many lack gender focal points. This Study recommends that country gender focal points be dedicated experts with sufficient seniority and time to be taken seriously. Some gender focal points recently received gender training but it is premature to assess the training impact. A deeper analysis of regional gender patterns is presented here:

Africa (AFR) – AFR's gender coordinator is located in the joint PREM-ESSD Poverty Reduction and Social Policy unit. The current coordinator has worked in the region for many years, providing desirable continuity. Unfortunately, AFR's gender staff has shrunk over the last few years. The regional gender coordinator pointed out that the insufficient number of gender experts and financial resources constrains the possibility of fully implementing the Strategy. The region has three gender experts addressing about 40 countries. The country-based gender focal point system is not working very well in AFR. Although some gender focal points do a fine job, others are hardly aware of their gender responsibilities.

East Asia and Pacific (EAP) – EAP's regional gender coordinator moved from headquarters to the Thailand Country Office in 2002. She is affiliated with ESSD. Because of this decentralization, an HD headquarters staff represents EAP at the Gender and Development Board meetings. Several EAP Country Offices have dedicated gender coordinators rather than part-time focal points. EAP's regional Vice President deserves credit for pro-actively promoting gender mainstreaming. He has proposed convening a videoconference with Country Office gender coordinators and suggested that country directors and lead economists participate. This high level attention to gender should send a strong message about the importance of gender in EAP. However, the EAP regional Chief Economist and country economists expressed no interest in gender issues when the lead author interviewed them in 2000 for a macroeconomic policy and gender analysis (Zuckerman 2000b).

²³ As stated in "Gender Mainstreaming in the South Asia Region", a Bank staff presentation to the Gender and Development Board, April, 18, 2005.

²⁴ In a discussion with the lead author during the spring of 2003.

Latin America and the Caribbean (LAC) – LAC’s gender coordinator reports to the Sector Manager for Poverty and Gender, who reports to the PREM Director. Prior to the 1995 Beijing conference, LAC had virtually no gender experts, lagging behind the other regions. Later, it surpassed other regions by developing a full headquarters unit employing about a dozen gender experts who have generated high quality work including valuable research on a range of gender topics and gender mainstreaming of various operations by demonstrating that gender can enhance project efficiency (Annex 4). LAC’s gender unit developed a best practice of generating demand for its gender experts to contribute to operations

Middle East and North Africa (MENA) – MENA’s gender coordinator, like LAC’s, reports to the Chief Economist/PREM Director. The MENA Chief Economist has also been a gender advocate. MENA has the most enormous gender gaps among regions, with by far the lowest female labor participation rate with only 29% of women working; only 39 percent of women over 15 years of age in the region are literate (Annex 5). The gender coordinator pointed out that despite regional gender stereotypes, more males than females attend Bank regional gender meetings.

Europe and Central Asia (ECA) – ECA’s gender coordinator has faced an uphill battle to convince colleagues that there are significant gender gaps in a region where gender indicators are the most equal of all regions (Annex 5). Women’s social indicators are excellent because they are a legacy of the egalitarian-oriented socialist era. However, as a result of market liberalization and other structural reforms, serious gender gaps have emerged such as renewed discrimination in hiring women, sexual harassment in the workplace, domestic violence, trafficking in women and the disproportionate effects of the collapse of the pension system on the high number of regional widows (Paci 2002).

South Asia Region (SAR) – SAR’s gender work is coordinated by ESSD. The region has strong gender staffing in country departments. Bank work in some SAR countries, for example Nepal and Sri Lanka, routinely mainstream gender into analytical work and operations, because their staff include gender experts. SAR gender experts face tremendous challenges: In SAR countries, 56 percent of women are illiterate (Annex 5) and violence against women is extraordinarily high and severe.

4.1.2 Incentive Funding

The World Bank Management Committee provided a \$600,000 one-year Incentive Fund for Gender Mainstreaming to facilitate Strategy implementation during fiscal year 2002. The grant was funded by the Bank’s Global Public Goods (GPG) resources. Each of the Bank’s six regions received \$100,000 from the Incentive Fund. All regions spent the full amount except for SAR. This limited one-year funding for Strategy implementation leaves the regions with few or no resources to implement the Strategy except for any funds they can obtain from Country Directors who have many competing claims on their funds. The very modest one-year Incentive Funding reflects the low priority gender commands among Bank priorities.

4.1.3 New Operational Policy and Bank Procedures Statements on Gender and Development

All Bank investments must conform to a set of Operational Policies (OPs) and Bank Procedures (BPs) contained in the Bank Operational Manual issued to each staff member. Their purposes in the Bank's own language are as follows: "Operational Policies (OPs) are short, focused statements that follow from the Bank's Articles of Agreement, the general conditions and policies approved by the Board of Executive Directors. They establish the parameters for the conduct of operations, describe the circumstances in which exceptions to policy are admissible, and spell out who authorizes exceptions. Bank Procedures (BPs) explain how Bank staff carry out the OPs by describing the procedures and documentation required to ensure Bankwide consistency and quality."²⁵

In March 2003, Bank management issued the new "Gender and Development" Operational Policy (OP 4.20) and companion Bank Procedure (BP 4.20) (World Bank Operational Manual 2003b and 2003c) with no objection from the Board of Directors. Both explicitly draw on the Gender Strategy. OP 4.20 revises the preceding 1999 version that in turn replaced the original OP 4.20 first approved in 1994.²⁶ BP 4.20 is entirely new. The full texts of the OP 4.20²⁷ and BP 4.20²⁸ can be accessed on the Bank website.

The latest OP is more specific than the 1999 version. The latest version states that the Bank will prepare a Country Gender Assessment (CGA) for each borrower country. In turn the CGA will inform policy dialogue with the country and feed into the Bank's Country Assistance Strategy (CAS) and projects.

The new BP states that the Country Director oversees preparation of the CGA that can be based on Bank gender analysis and consultations or those undertaken by other organizations. Specifically, a footnote states that, "The gender assessment may be a stand-alone assessment or may be carried out as part of other Bank economic and sector work, such as poverty assessments, country economic memoranda, public expenditure reviews, development policy reviews, poverty and social impact assessments, or institutional analyses. Alternatively, it may be an assessment that has been carried out by the country or an organization other than the Bank, if the Bank finds the assessment to be satisfactory." A regional gender coordinator underlined that with many competing resources, it will be tempting to use non-CGA instruments without guaranteeing their quality given that most of the cited Bank alternatives have historically underplayed gender issues.

²⁵ <http://web.worldbank.org/WBSITE/EXTERNAL/EXTABOUTUS/0,,contentMDK:20040574~menuPK:34574~pagePK:34542~piPK:36600~theSitePK:29708,00.html>.

²⁶ The revised OP 4.20 also replaces the "Operational Memorandum on Gender and Development" (OMGD) that the Bank issued in late 2001 presenting interim guidelines to staff for strengthening implementation of the 1999 OP 4.20 and promoting the recently endorsed Gender Strategy.

²⁷ <http://wbln0018.worldbank.org/institutional/manuals/opmanual.nsf/OPow?OpenView>.

²⁸ <http://wbln0018.worldbank.org/institutional/manuals/opmanual.nsf/BProw?OpenView>.

The BP also lists typical gender assessment content such as distinct male-female socioeconomic roles, gender disparities in access, control and use of assets and resources, human development indicators, participation in decision-making and causes for gender discrimination or inequalities. In addition, the new BP assigns Bank managers and staff responsibilities for translating gender assessment results into the CAS and projects and for internal reporting on implementing this policy. The revised OP and BP definitely improve on the preceding policy but they perpetuate an unfunded unmandated Gender Strategy. Implications include that CGAs are likely to be of variable quality and will not be adequately reflected in investments.

4.1.4 Incorporating Gender Dimensions into Other Operational Policies

Including Operational Policy OP 4.20, the Bank has some 30 operational policies listed on its website.²⁹ According to gender anchor staff, they have engendered the Social Development OP and plan to engender the Poverty OP. This Study could find no operational policies with these or similar names among the 30 included on the Bank website. The gender anchor stated it intends to engender other operational policies with time. The anchor should consider accelerating engendering the many OPs that are very influential in project design such as the 10 mandatory Safeguard Policies included among the OPs. Many civil society organizations have complained that the Bank's recent streamlining of OPs has diluted their contents and impacts (Rich 2002).

4.1.5 Mainstreaming Gender into Joint Staff Assessments (JSAs), Country Assistance Strategies (CASs), Quality Assurance Group (QAG) Assessments

Joint Staff Assessments (JSAs)/ Joint Staff Advisory Notes (JSANs)

The World Bank and International Monetary Fund (IMF) produce Joint Staff Assessments (JSAs), recently renamed Joint Staff Advisory Notes (JSANs) of Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers (PRSPs) that accompany PRSPs presented to the institutions' Boards of Directors. The Bank and the IMF introduced PRSPs as a prerequisite for the poorest countries participating in the Highly Indebted Poor Country (HIPC) initiative to have their Bank and Fund debts reduced. Subsequently, the Bank and the Fund introduced PRSPs in non-HIPC low-income developing and transition countries too.

JSAs/JSANs assess for the Boards whether or not PRSPs provide a sound basis for concessional assistance from the Bank and the Fund. They analyze how rigorously PRSPs address poverty, environmental and other issues. To determine the extent to which JSA assessments address gender needs, this study

²⁹ <http://wbi018.worldbank.org/institutional/manuals/opmanual.nsf/>.

analyzed the JSA Guidelines and another Gender Action report analyzed all 2002 JSAs for gender (Zuckerman and Garrett 2003). This Study concluded that JSA Guidelines need to more rigorously flag gender issues. Zuckerman and Garrett concluded that JSA gender analyses are of highly variable quality and tend to be superficial. Since each country JSA is appropriately undertaken by staff members who are country experts, it is not surprising that there is no consistency in JSA content. But they should consistently include a high-quality gender analysis. The analysis of 2002 JSAs revealed that for the 13 PRSPs produced in 2002, two JSAs were removed from the Bank website shortly after Gender Action's analyst noted they lacked gender analysis. Of the 11 JSAs that then remained on the Bank website, some 7 or two thirds superficially analyzed PRSPs for gender and two neglected gender issues altogether.³⁰ Curiously, the JSAs for some of the better engendered PRSPs like those of Malawi and Rwanda contained negligible information about gender issues (Zuckerman and Garrett 2003). A more fundamental problem is that PRSPs are frameworks to promote economic conditions that have harmful effects on poor men and women. JSA/JSAN inputs and required World Bank and IMF Board approval of PRSPs undermine the claim that PRSPs are country owned.

Country Assistance Strategies (CASs)

Since the advent of Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers (PRSPs), CASs have become country business plans defining the composition of Bank assistance in support of the "country-owned" PRSP. Previous CASs formulated the framework for Bank investments based on a Bank analysis of development needs in consultation with the country. Now the "country owned" PRSP is supposed to identify these needs.³¹ Bank country department staff members prepare CASs for their countries every three years.

Operational Policy 4.20, "Gender and Development", discussed above, explicitly recommends that CASs integrate gender analysis (World Bank 2003b). Moreover, the Gender Strategy establishes a process whereby Country Gender Assessments (CGAs), the Gender Strategy centerpiece, will feed into CASs.

The World Bank's own gender anchor reviews of CASs show they are becoming increasingly attentive to gender issues. From fiscal year 1998-99 to fiscal year 1999-2000 the proportion of CASs rated satisfactory or very satisfactory in addressing gender issues increased from 53 percent to 61 percent and the proportion rated unsatisfactory or marginally satisfactory declined from 47 percent to 39 percent (World Bank 2003d). Indeed, CASs today are mainstreaming gender better than previously.

³⁰ Denise Colbert, a Gender Action volunteer, analyzed all 2002 JSAs for gender. Her analysis is incorporated into Zuckerman and Garrett 2003, available at www.genderaction.org.

³¹ Countries do not feel that Bank and IMF mandated PRSPs elaborating structural adjustment content and requiring Bank and IMF Board approval can be genuinely country-owned. For more information on country ownership of PRSPs, see Zuckerman 2002a and Zuckerman and Garrett 2003.

However, at the time of the first printing of this Study Gender Action found that CASs are far from universally engendered. Here are a few regional examples. MENA gender staff related that they had recently analyzed seven CASs. They found that three addressed gender disparities (Algeria, Egypt and Yemen), two included a gender box (Morocco and Tunisia), and two did not address gender at all (Jordan and Lebanon). It is surprising that the Morocco CAS only included a box on gender since Moroccan women's civil society groups prepared an excellent in-depth country gender assessment in 1999 with Bank support (Royaume 1999). But the Moroccan CGA did not feed into the CAS. MENA staff members expect the Iran CAS for the fiscal year 2004 to be engendered.

LAC's gender staff reported that prior to the Strategy they focused less on engendering CASs than on producing Country Gender Assessments as a direct entry point to integrating gender into projects. They adopted this approach to achieve greater impact with limited resources. With the arrival of a new LAC gender coordinator, the region is likely to renew emphasis on engendering CASs.

EAP's gender staff reported that the Philippines and Thailand CASs included gender inputs and the Cambodia and Laos CGAs were expected to feed into these countries' CASs.

But the latest Bank CAS for China, EAP's and the entire Bank's largest client, seriously neglected gender issues. This Study featuring China as its case country assessed the extent to which the China CAS integrated gender issues. The latest China CAS was published in 2003. The Bank's first China Country Gender Review (CGR), written and available to Bank staff since 2000, was published in Chinese and English in 2002 virtually verbatim with a new foreword (World Bank 2002b). The China CGR provides an in-depth analysis of a host of gender issues including the legal and regulatory framework, labor market, poverty, and other issues that are very relevant to the new CAS. China CGR contents should have fed into the CAS. The CAS missed the opportunity to integrate the China CGR analysis and recommendations. The text of the China CAS only mentions gender once. However, the CAS includes a short annex summarizing the CGR that is clearly an add-on. Since this summary of gender recommendations for China's Bank portfolio is the 18th out of 20 annexes, few are likely to read and use it. The gender annex is neither referenced nor integrated into the CAS text.

Even if CASs integrate gender issues satisfactorily, addressing them in Bank investments remains a major challenge. Most often gender issues in investments center around girls' education, maternal mortality and reproductive health. According to the Bank gender anchor's own assessment, "While almost 23 percent and 21 percent of the CASs proposed gender-specific actions in the education and health sectors respectively, just over 4 percent of the CASs proposed such actions in the infrastructure sector." (World Bank 2003d).

Quality Assurance Group (QAG) Assessments

Quality Assurance Group (QAG) reviews are supposed to assess Bank operations for quality. Some argue that QAGs measure the extent to which project staff

follows Bank guidelines rather than the quality and effectiveness of Bank operations in reducing poverty and meeting other social objectives (Zuckerman 2001). The QAG produces annual Quality at Entry (QEA), Quality of Supervision (QSA) and Quality of Economic and Sector Work (QESW) reports. These reports summarize QAG assessments of individual projects and analytical work. Until recently, QAG reviews paid little attention to gender. For example, the 1999 QEA assessment questionnaire only cited gender once in parentheses as follows: "Project/Program social impacts disaggregated by social groups (e.g., gender) and adequate provisions made for mitigation of adverse impacts, if any?" In contrast, the same QEA questionnaire included multiple explicit environmental questions. According to gender anchor staff, both the QEA and QESW have new explicit gender questions asking if projects analyze gender, contain gender related actions, include women's participation, promote women's empowerment and monitor for gender. This is a major improvement over the previous parenthetical reference to gender. Hopefully the QSA questionnaire and other new QAG products will also be engendered.

4.1.6 New Gender Monitoring and Evaluation System

In 2002, the gender anchor developed and implemented the new monitoring and evaluation system that the Strategy calls for. The anchor solicited inputs from each of the regions and in turn synthesized these inputs into a report it sent to the Board in early 2003. According to the Strategy, vice-presidents took responsibility for submitting these monitoring reports. In reality, the burden belonged to the regional gender coordinators who submitted their reports. Some regional gender coordinators complained that the information solicited was weak and unclear. Some regions submitted the best possible information under the circumstances while others made less of an effort. This Study would have benefited from reviewing the FY2002 and FY2003 annual Strategy monitoring reports that were submitted to the Board but they were confidential documents at the time of writing. Subsequently they both were supposed to be published on the World Bank website. However, the relevant Bank links have not worked, a common Bank URL problem discussed in Section 4.2.7 below. In any case, the Bank discontinued producing these Strategy monitoring reports in favor of including a brief gender monitoring update in an overall "Sector Strategy Implementation Update".

4.2 Ongoing Strategy Targets

4.2.1 Mainstreaming Gender into Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers (PRSPs)

As noted above, the World Bank and the International Monetary Fund (IMF) introduced PRSPs as a prerequisite for the poorest countries participating in the Highly Indebted Poor Country (HIPC) initiative to have their Bank and Fund debts

reduced.³² Subsequently, the Bank and the Fund introduced PRSPs in non-HIPC low-income developing and transition countries too. PRSPs are required for Bank and Fund lending in increasing numbers of developing and transition countries. As of early 2005, 43 countries had completed PRSPs and 50 had produced Interim PRSPs (IPRSPs). PRSPs have become de facto Bank and Fund mandated national economic plans directed at reducing poverty. They are supposed to be “country-owned”, expressing not only government but also broad civil society interests solicited through participatory consultations. But their country ownership is felt less in their countries of origin than in the minds of development agency staff. That Bank and IMF Boards of Directors must approve PRSP underlines that they are not country-owned. PRSPs promote economic conditions imposing hardships on the poor that mock their “poverty reduction” names.

Today the Bank and Fund, most bilateral aid agencies, and the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) all require PRSPs as a prerequisite for receiving development assistance. These agencies have been actively promoting and financing PRSP preparation. The Bank itself prepared an elaborate PRSP Sourcebook discussing in great detail what a PRSP should contain (World Bank 2001b). Recognizing that engendering PRSPs is critical for achieving their poverty reduction goals, the Gender anchor contributed a long chapter to the Bank PRSP Sourcebook on how to engender the PRSP. Anchor staff tried to engender other Sourcebook chapters.³³ The Bank has organized a number of workshops around PRSPs and gender, both at headquarters and regionally.

The Gender Strategy features a full page box presenting the good practice example of mainstreaming gender into the Cambodia Interim PRSP. The Strategy states that Country Directors are responsible for integrating country gender assessment findings into PRSP processes.

However, Gender Action’s in-depth audit of all 2002 PRSPs for gender issues demonstrates that of the 13 PRSPs produced that year, only 3 PRSPs address gender issues commendably but not completely (Malawi, Rwanda and Zambia), another 8 PRSPs spottily apply an outdated Women in Development approach, defining gender issues as reproductive health, girls’ education and a few other issues that vary by country, and the remaining two PRSPs almost neglect gender issues. Only two PRSPs promote women’s rights (Malawi, Rwanda). Very importantly, no 2002 PRSP engenders structural adjustment measures like trade liberalization and privatization that are central to PRSPs despite the growing body of relevant analytical tools for doing so. Malawi’s gender PRSP Task Force prepared inputs on gender and macroeconomic and other issues that the PRSP writing group ignored because of “space constraints”.³⁴ Most PRSPs state that women are included in their participatory consultations but none breaks down the numbers of men and women consulted or indicates whether their surveys

³² This introduction to PRSPs reflects some of the content of Zuckerman 2002a and Zuckerman and Garrett 2003.

³³ This Study’s lead author, working as a gender anchor consultant, and former anchor staff member Michael Bamberger, provided feedback to Sourcebook chapter authors on how to integrate gender issues into them.

³⁴ A Malawi PRSP writer related this to this Study’s lead author in Lilonwe, Malawi in late 2003.

included gender related questions. Few PRSP contain sex-disaggregated data. Rwanda's is the only PRSP that tries to engender expenditures wherever possible. As pointed out above, this Gender Action analysis also found that the majority of Joint Staff Assessments that accompany PRSPs to the Bank and Fund Boards contain at best superficial gender analyses (Zuckerman and Garrett 2003).

Most regional gender coordinators have been sponsoring or participating in workshops to engender PRSPs. ECA provided an engendering PRSP workshop for former Council of Independent States PRSP stakeholders. But the two 2002 PRSPs that were weakest on gender, those of Albania and Tajikistan, were from the only two ECA countries that produced PRSPs that year.

EAP organized regional Gender Mainstreaming workshops in Hanoi in 2002 and Cambodia in 2003. It also convened workshops for over 500 provincial officials responsible for PRSP implementation. Nevertheless, the Vietnam PRSP integrated gender to some extent but provided no budget to back up recommendations (Zuckerman 2002b and 2002c; Zuckerman and Garrett 2003).

In the South Asia Region (SAR), the Bangladesh PRSP is expected to mainstream gender. Bangladesh's Interim PRSP integrated gender issues more systematically than other I-PRSPs partly thanks to the donor-based Local Consultative Group on Women's Advancement and Gender Equality (LCE WAGE sub-group) supporting this effort and very active civil society contributions. LCE WAGE sub-group is underwriting analyses and workshops to ensure the PRSP is engendered.³⁵ Bank SAR staff reported that Sri Lanka's PRSP and its first Poverty Reduction Support Credit (PRSC I) address important gender issues (SAR 2002).

The LAC gender unit has not targeted mainstreaming gender into PRSPs. Neither the Bolivia, Guyana nor Nicaragua PRSPs adequately address gender gaps (Zuckerman and Garrett 2002; Zuckerman 2002c).³⁶

Advocacy around engendering PRSPs still has a long way to go. Since un-engendered PRSPs implicitly reinforce unequal gender patterns that hinder development, Gender Action has made PRSPs a key focus of our advocacy work. To date, Gender Action is collaborating with civil society groups in Bangladesh, Bosnia, Eritrea, Mozambique, Malawi, Namibia and Rwanda. Through these partnerships we deconstruct these countries' PRSPs for gender impacts and conduct advocacy to engender their contents and implementation. Gender Action has also analyzed many more PRSPs for gendered impacts. While PRSP engendering is starting to show results, Gender Action raises more fundamental questions around PRSPs' Bank-Fund driven structural adjustment frameworks, the legitimacy of country participation and ownership of PRSP content, and the gendered impacts of these questions.³⁷

³⁵ Gender Action is also playing an advocacy role on engendering the Bangladesh PRSP.

³⁶ MENA is not mentioned in this PRSP section since it does include PRSP countries.

³⁷ These issues are explored in a series of Gender Action papers at www.genderaction.org.

4.2.2 Integrating Gender into World Bank Institute (WBI) Courses

The World Bank Institute, the Bank's "capacity development arm", "helps countries share and apply global and local knowledge to meet development challenges" (World Bank 2005a).

Since our first printing stated that "WBI courses do not yet systematically integrate gender but they are making a serious effort in that direction", WBI has made some progress in meeting its gender agenda. It created a Gender Coordinator position situated in its Sector and Thematic Group.

In 2002, a gender consultant analyzed the extent to which WBI courses integrate gender and recommended how to expand gender coverage (Scott 2002). The analysis concluded that although a few courses integrate gender, large gaps remain. Some courses hardly integrate gender (such as Globalization and Macroeconomics; Trade; and Infrastructure Regulation), other courses integrate gender to some extent (such as Global Governance; Public Finance, Decentralization and Poverty Reduction, and Community Empowerment and Social Inclusion) and traditional women in development sectors integrate gender most deeply (such as the Leadership Program on HIV/AIDs; and Education). This replicates the pattern of gender analysis of all Bank products from investment projects to "country owned" Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers, where HIV/AIDs, education and reproductive health are by far the most engendered issues. Since 2002, WBI staff have made a little progress in engendering more courses but in 2005 the picture this paragraph describes is still relevant.

Although not every WBI course mainstreams gender, WBI hopes to achieve that goal. The Coordinator implemented many of the recommendations that the gender consultant proposed in 2002 (Scott 2002). These include gender training for some WBI staff and gender webpages that, however, are internal for Bank staff only. Gender Action recommends that these pages be published on the Bank's external website.

4.2.3 Creating a Series of Technical Modules for Training Staff and Clients on Gender Issues

Consistent with the World Bank's constant reorganizations, the locus of staff training has shifted since the first printing from WBI to Human Resources. An induction module for new staff includes a gender component. However, training for existing staff remains voluntary. Most participants at almost all Bank gender trainings are gender advocates. The Bank has not figured out how to attract its non-gender experts to gender training. To date, it has rejected mandating gender training for all staff and managers. Gender Action recommends that the Bank create mandatory gender training modules for all staff to facilitate achieving its poverty reduction mission that depends on targeting women who compose 70 percent of the world's poor.

To disseminate Strategy priorities, the gender anchor has been presenting training modules on Country Gender Assessments and mainstreaming gender into projects at network learning events like the annual Environmentally and Socially Sustainable Development (ESSD) and Poverty Reduction and Economic Management (PREM) “weeks”. These “weeks” are actually a few days of training workshops where network staff select among competing parallel training offerings. Thus only self-selected staff attend the gender training modules.

At this time, addressing gender in Bank training remains very sporadic. For example, the World Bank-World Vision daylong learning event, “Democratizing Development: Social Accountability Through Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers (PRSPs)”, convened in the World Bank for the September 2002 Bank-Fund Annual Meetings, virtually did not mention gender issues although PRSPs must address them to achieve their objectives (Zuckerman 2002a). The word “gender” was mentioned only once in passing during the daylong series of Bank senior manager and staff presentations. No Bank gender specialists attended, neither from the gender anchor nor the regions.³⁸ Upon inquiring, the Study authors learned that Bank gender experts were not notified about this event despite their desire to engender PRSPs. This Study recommends that the Bank invite the Gender and Development Board to all important Bank activities because gender is a cross-cutting issue as the Strategy underlines.

4.2.4 Developing Informal Learning Events

For many years, the WID and gender units have delivered informal WID and gender learning events for Bank staff. Brown bag luncheons have been the most popular informal learning event format, because staff attendance tends to be higher during short lunch breaks than at longer training events. During lunchtime on any day, Bank staff can make choices among several brown bag lunch learning events. To attract participants, this competitive time slot requires presenters to be interesting and relevant.

The gender anchor and regional coordinators periodically organize ad hoc brown bag luncheons presentations. They cover a large range of topics, for example gender and information technology, engendering national budgets, the gendered impacts of armed conflict and the gender ramifications of countries’ constitutions and laws. Frequently, these brown bag lunch events feature the results of work of Bank gender consultants. Sometimes they present gender data on project results, outcomes of gender projects or engendering tools for project managers. Occasionally they feature government, private or civil society initiatives that are compatible with the Bank’s development approaches or that the Bank directly supports.

Bank gender experts have debated whether it would be effective to require mandatory gender training for all staff. So far, they have rejected this option as infeasible for very busy Bank staff.

³⁸ Both Gender Action and InterAction’s Commission on the Advancement of Women attended the September 2002 PRSP workshop.

This Study recommends that the Bank sponsor high-quality mandatory gender training for all staff and gender orientation for new staff and managers including and especially in country offices given the Bank's increasing decentralization. Since many countries offices do not have gender experts who could provide this training, the Bank needs to make special arrangements for gender experts to visit them or even better hire gender experts for each country office. Orientation for new staff is already supposed to cover gender issues but one country chief economist reported that to meet this requirement he merely mentioned gender in his presentation to new staff. Bilateral agencies that have mandatory gender training for all staff and managers appear to have deeper gender mindsets although there are no studies that prove this outcome.

4.2.5 Template/Adaptable Tools

The Strategy promotes upgrading gender templates and sector toolkits to help staff integrate gender into their activities. Long before the Strategy appeared, the gender anchor had published sector toolkits on the central gender website for agriculture, transport, and water and sanitation. Some country offices had prepared briefing notes for several sectors. The India Country Office in 2002, for example, developed a toolkit on Gender in Resettlement and Rehabilitation that is being field tested and disseminated (South Asia 2002). These are valuable initiatives, but they only cover a thin slice of Bank sectors. Hopefully the Strategy will accelerate coverage of other sectors. The critical outcome, getting project managers to use these tools, will remain an uphill struggle, unless the Bank mandates their use.

4.2.6 A Database on Where to Acquire Gender Expertise

Each of the regions have developed gender expert databases.. However some of the regional gender coordinators feel these databases need updating. Most of these lists are available to Bank staff but are not published on the Bank external gender web pages.

4.2.7 Enhancing Engendering Tools on the Bank Website

The Strategy establishes the target to continuously enhance Bank website engendering tools. This section analyzes the gender pages of the Bank's external website, www.worldbank.org/gender, for quality and user-friendliness of the contents, as well as a few other Bank website topics.³⁹ The Bank has external and internal websites. The internal site or Bank Intranet, available only to Bank staff and consultants, contains more information on gender than does the external site. This section should be read with Annex 6 that analyzes the Bank gender webpages in depth.

³⁹ Most of the information in this analysis of the Bank website was prepared expressly for this Study by gender and development expert Hilary Sims Feldstein on behalf of Gender Action.

Overall, the Bank gender webpages have improved between 2003 and 2005. On the external Bank website, the central gender anchor has rich Gender and Development pages containing the Gender Strategy, policy documents, gender statistics (“Gender Stats”) that include sex disaggregated data for many countries, sector tools, Bank publications on gender, PRSP and gender information, good practice examples of engendered Bank operations and links to other gender websites and other resources. Compared to 2003, the 2005 site contains more material on operational procedures, guidelines and analytical tools.

It is disappointing, though, that the Gender and Development webpage Social Assessment discussion states, “the Bank does not consider it mandatory to gather gender-disaggregated data and to develop specific recommendations for women and men in the given context.”(Emphasis added.) Without mandates gender equality is unlikely to make serious headway in the Bank because Bank staff responds to incentives.⁴⁰

Four regions have gender pages reachable from the Gender and Development Homepage: Africa (AFR), Europe and Central Asia (ECA), Latin America and the Caribbean (LAC), and the Middle East and North Africa (MENA). The quality of these four regional gender sites vary. AFR has an impressive gender website that includes its Africa Region Gender Strategy and Work Program, gender statistical profiles for African countries, the 10 Country Gender Assessments available for African countries and more information on HIV/AIDS than it had two years ago. LAC’s gender webpages are also excellent. ECA’s and MENA’s gender webpages present useful information on key regional gender issues, but their sites are less developed than AFR’s and LAC’s. The other two regions – East Asia and Pacific (EAP) and South Asia (SAR) – do not have dedicated gender webpages. They merely have bits and pieces related to gender scattered on other regional web pages that require a huge amount of labor to find. EAP and SAR present lots of information on their intranet gender web pages that are not available to the public. All the regions should present gender information on the Bank’s external website.

Besides exploring the Bank gender pages through the sectors and topics and by region, we also examined World Bank Institute (WBI) web pages for gender content. The WBI site does not yet have dedicated gender pages on the Bank’s external website. Apparently, the WBI pages include a resource section on gender budgeting, but it must take considerable digging to find it.⁴¹ A WBI consultant gender analysis recommended developing WBI gender pages that would include a best practice database for gender mainstreamed WBI activities; engendered case study materials; announcements of gender-focused training events; and links to key World Bank and external gender sites (Scott 2002).

As a final check of Bank website pages, the Study authors selectively surveyed some Bank website pages on subjects that typically neglect gender to see if the Strategy and Bank messages around gender are influencing them. A look at the

⁴⁰ Most staff everywhere respond to incentives, but in the case of the World Bank the lead author speaks from first hand experience there.

⁴¹ The lead author could not find it through a quick WBI web pages search.

Private Sector Development (PSD) page indicated gender is not discussed despite a new PSD Gender-Enterprise-Markets (GEM) program promoting women’s increasing role in the private sector. PSD pages still contain no obvious link to the Bank’s microcredit programs that are conventionally associated with women. Our look at the Bank website Trade pages found one paper on gender and trade listed among publications but little else on women’s role in trade despite a large number of initiatives outside the Bank addressing this issue. Our check of the Bank Transport home page indicated it contains no links to or mention of the gender anchor web pages on transport and gender. Nor does it refer to gender issues in any other way. Some other Bank web pages including the Conflict Prevention and Reconstruction and Health, Population and Nutrition pages integrate gender issues better. This Study recommends that the Bank enhance gender linkages among its web pages to potentially expose many more staff to gender needs and tools.

A common problem on all the Bank gender webpages are unworkable links. To list just a handful, for example the Gender and Development links to its annual monitoring reports, to five of six agriculture tools papers, to a trade and gender summary and to the AFR gender website links to HIV/AIDS information and to the African Development Bank did not function. The Bank should ensure its gender web page links work.

Table 2 below summarizes the findings of our Bank gender web page analysis. A detailed tabular analysis of Bank gender pages is presented in Annex 6.

Table 2. World Bank External Website Gender Pages
<http://www.worldbank.org/gender>

Website Page	Gender Value	Sample Gender Content
Gender Anchor Gender and Development	Rich dedicated gender website Easy to access	Gender Stats, Toolkits, Strategy, Policies, Best Practices, Links to AFR, ECA, LAC and MENA and partner organization gender websites
AFR	Rich but somewhat outdated gender site Easy to access	Consultant database, Country Focal points, NGOs, Publications, HIV/AIDS Content, PRSP discussion
EAP	No gender site found Regional Sectors & Topics do not include gender	No gender content
ECA	No gender site found Regional Sectors & Topics do not include gender among them	Regional pages contain the publication, “Gender in Transition” (Paci 2002) Social development site cites the role of women very occasionally
LAC	Rich but somewhat outdated gender website Easy to access	Extensive publications on gender including Country Gender Reviews Engendered projects Regional gender employment statistics Research publications
MENA	Informative Easy to access	MENA Consultative Council on Gender Almost all regional topics address gender
SAR	No gender site found	Inconsistent attention to gender in regional projects and country briefs

4.2.8 Enhancing and Continuing Collaboration with Civil Society, Other Donors, and the UN System

Civil Society

To date, the gender anchor has limited its collaboration to a few select civil society groups. Its main link with civil society has been via the Bank-appointed External Gender Consultative Group (EGCG). President Wolfensohn established the EGCG as a result of his meeting at the Beijing Fourth World Conference on Women in 1995 where women's organizations demanded that the Bank better integrate gender in its operations. EGCG members, who hold two to three-year terms, are appointed by the Bank President. They are gender experts with deep experience in civil society networks. The Bank finances the travel of the overseas EGCG members as well as the Washington DC meetings of all members. In earlier years, EGCG had a dozen members but currently has only seven, one from each Bank region plus a US member.⁴²

The effectiveness of the EGCG has varied over time. At this publication's first printing, EGCG members lamented that they had been unable to maintain EGCG's previous more intensive level of commitment.⁴³ Although now a smaller group, current members feel the EGCG has been more effective.

From 1996 to the present, the EGCG has met roughly every year and a half in Washington DC with Bank staff for two to three days, "as a mechanism for accountability".⁴⁴ EGCG members contributed important feedback to drafts of "Engendering Development" (World Bank 2001a) and the Gender Strategy. Since the Strategy was launched in 2001, EGCG has focused on its implementation as well as advising the Bank on operations and policies.

Besides the EGCG, at the regional level, a few years ago MENA developed its own NGO Consultative Council. The Council has played a valuable role in providing feedback on MENA gender initiatives. It periodically meets to provide advice to the regional gender coordinator.

At the country level, the India gender focal point has already initiated a local EGCG network and some other SAR countries might also develop such local networks. The gender anchor has discussed expanding local civil society country level-EGCGs but at this time no decision to do so has been taken.

The Bank espouses the importance of engaging civil society but has limited its contacts to a few hand-picked civil society organizations. Moreover, it has ignored the recommendations of major reports it prepared with civil society groups such as the Structural Adjustment Participatory Review Initiative (SAPRI). The

⁴²<http://web.worldbank.org/WBSITE/EXTERNAL/TOPICS/EXTGENDER/0,,contentMDK:20180669~menuPK:489609~pagePK:148956~piPK:216618~theSitePK:336868,00.html>

⁴³ Meetings between the lead author and the EGCG head and members during 2002.

⁴⁴ EGCG member Suzanne Kindervatter, who heads InterAction's Commission on the Advancement of Women, provided this quote and much of the information in this section.

Bank overall, and the gender unit, need to genuinely listen to civil society and especially to the “voices of the peoples” affected by Bank policies and practices.

Other Donors and the UN System

The gender anchor maintains considerable collaboration with other donors. The Bank Gender Director is an observer at the OECD Network on Gender Equality. Bilateral donor agencies have underwritten key Bank gender initiatives. Examples include bilateral support for “Engendering Development” (World Bank 2001a) and for various Operations Evaluation Department analyses of gender mainstreaming in the Bank (OED 2000). Bilateral agencies have been quite influential in establishing Bank gender initiatives.

Also, the gender anchor collaborates closely with the UN system including with the United Nations Development Program (UNDP), Fund for Population Activities (UNFPA) and Fund for Women (UNIFEM). The Country Gender Assessments (CGAs) that the Strategy promotes will sometimes be collaborative products with UN partner agencies. For example, UNDP is contributing funds to prepare Madagascar’s CGA. On a selective country basis, UNDP also supports gender integration into the preparation of some Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers (PRSPs) that the Bank requires of International Development Agency (IDA) borrowers. The gender anchor completed an analysis of why gender is important for the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) that the UN formulated with inputs from the Bank and other stakeholders (World Bank 2003e).

4.3. Longer Term Targets – Foundations Laid and Progress Achieved

4.3.1 Preparing Country Gender Assessments (CGAs)

Preparing CGAs is the Gender Strategy centerpiece. The Strategy defines the essence of CGAs as “.....a periodic assessment of gender issues in each country in which the Bank has an active lending program” (World Bank 2002a). The Strategy explains that the purpose of the CGA is to:

“analyze the gender dimensions of development; identify gender responsive policies and actions important for poverty reduction, economic growth, human well-being and development effectiveness in the country; and to integrate these policies and actions into policy dialogue and the country assistance program”.

According to the Strategy, the CGA normally includes:

- A profile of male and female socioeconomic roles
- Gender disparities in access to, control over and use of assets and productive resources and in human development indicators

- Inequalities between males and females in the ability to participate in development decision making, laws, institutional frameworks, norms and other practices leading to gender discrimination
- The country context including the legal and regulatory framework and institutional arrangements
- A review of the gender dimensions of the Bank portfolio
- Gender responsive policy and operational interventions.

Like other Strategy priorities, CGAs are not new in the Bank. The WID unit introduced them during the 1980s. In the late 1980s and early 1990s, the Bank produced solid CGAs for Bangladesh, India, Kenya and Mexico and subsequently for other countries under a variety of names including country gender reviews, strategies, analyses, issues papers, assessments, etc. Between 1998 and 2000, the Bank produced over 15 CGAs including the China Country Gender Review discussed in 3.2 (World Bank 2002b; (Zuckerman 2000a). The Strategy systematizes the preparation of CGAs for all countries for the first time. It replaces the previous ad hoc preparation of CGAs with a requirement that the Bank produce CGAs for every client country regularly. The Strategy states that Country Departments are responsible for preparing CGAs, that they produce one at least every five years for each country and that the first CGA for each country be produced by June 2005. This target has not been met.⁴⁵

The Strategy also suggests that CGAs should not be blueprinted. It emphasizes that a CGA could be a free-standing document or part of another analytical product such a Poverty Assessment, depending on country resources and needs.

Country Departments would normally finance CGAs, but Bank partner agencies could also underwrite CGAs. However, Country Department financing is desirable because it signals Bank commitment to promoting gender equality.

This Study expects that CGA quality is likely to vary across countries depending on many factors including the extent of stakeholder consultations, the degree of country ownership, the depth of data collection and fieldwork, and analysis of regional and local variations, *inter alia*. Past CGAs have been of varying quality depending on these factors (Zuckerman 2000a).

Each of the Bank's six regions is in a distinct phase of CGA preparation. As part of this Study's assessment of the extent to which the Strategy is being implemented, this Study describes the status of CGA preparation in each of the regions below. The uneven amount of information by region reflects the uneven status of CGA preparation. Only the Africa and South Asia descriptions below were updated for the second printing.

Africa Region (AFR) – AFR needs to produce 37 CGAs by 2005. However, the AFR gender website listed only 10 completed CGAs as of early 2005. The AFR gender coordinator felt the regional CGAs are expected to be prepared on time but to be of varying quality because of inadequate funding. AFR country budgets are squeezed by other *mandatory* analytical work leaving little funding

⁴⁵ We did not count the numbers of outstanding CGAs at the time of the second printing.

available for *optional* CGAs. Because of insufficient funding, the AFR gender coordinator considered piggybacking on mandatory analytical work such as the 30 Poverty Assessments (PAs) expected to be completed in the next two years. The coordinator rejected this option because regional PAs tend to contain weak gender analyses, typically mentioning female-headed households and girls' education but rarely addressing other important gender issues. PA guidelines lack strong gender criteria even after ten years of experience with them. AFR will prepare CGAs by patching together various funding sources including Bank Global Public Funds (central Bank funds), Country Department, bilateral, UNDP and other partner funds. The region produced its own Africa Region Gender Strategy (ARGS) that elaborates a regional CGA production schedule (World Bank 2002c). Thinking ahead, the AFR gender coordinator is concerned that the region will mobilize resources to produce CGAs and publish them but will lack resources to implement CGA recommendations.

Eastern Europe and Central Asia (ECA) – ECA, unlike AFR, is trying to include CGAs inside country Poverty Assessments rather than producing them independently.

East Asia and Pacific (EAP) – EAP has produced a regional CGA production schedule. It expects to produce three CGAs in each of fiscal year 2003 (Cambodia, China, Vietnam), fiscal year 2004 (Laos, Mongolia and the Philippines) and fiscal year 2005 (East Timor, Indonesia and Papua New Guinea). Of the regions' three remaining countries, as of 2003 the Bank was not planning to prepare CGAs for Malaysia and Thailand and it did not have the resources to prepare one for the Pacific Island countries.

Latin America and the Caribbean (LAC) – Prior to the strategy, LAC had already produced more CGAs than had other regions. In the second half of the 1990s, LAC developed a two-stage approach to mainstream gender into country work. The first stage was preparing a country gender review (CGR – another name for a country gender assessment -- CGA) that analyzed key country gender gaps and the Bank investment portfolio for gender and the second stage addressed gender issues in Bank projects. For economies of scale, LAC CGAs sometimes grouped countries, for example, it produced a CGA for five Central American countries and another for three southern cone countries. Recently LAC produced a Caribbean CGA covering three countries (Dominican Republic, Haiti and Jamaica). These multi-country CGAs analyze gender issues separately country by country but print them together to achieve savings. LAC has also produced individual CGAs for Ecuador and El Salvador. Encouragingly, LAC CGAs have not become shelf documents but have been used to engender Bank operations. This has been the result of the LAC gender unit pro-actively selling its gender expertise to Country Departments by promising to add value to Bank investments.

Middle East and North Africa (MENA) – Among the 10 borrower countries in MENA, only three CGAs were planned as of 2003 because of staff constraints. These were for Algeria, Egypt and Yemen.

South Asia Region (SAR) – SAR pioneered the Bank’s first deep country gender assessments – for Bangladesh, India and Pakistan some 15 years ago. Because these early gender analyses have been influential in getting SAR staff to promote women’s empowerment, the Gender Strategy is universalizing Country Gender Assessments (CGAs). Between 2003 and 2005, SAR has generated CGAs for Afghanistan, Nepal and Pakistan and is planning new CGAs for Bangladesh and Sri Lanka. These CGAs are premised on extensive stakeholder consultations with donors, the government and NGOs with the focus on mainstreaming gender into operations.

In conclusion, CGAs, the centerpieces of the Bank’s current gender strategy, run the risk of being ignored in project preparation and especially in implementation as have many poverty assessments and environmental assessments, both mandatory and recommended on a voluntary basis (Rich 2002). Our China case underscores this problem. China’s CGA was in place in time for a CAS and numerous investments but its contents were ignored. CGAs provide important analyses of country gender gaps that projects should address and try to narrow, but the Bank must provide incentives to project staff that they lack today for them to use CGAs effectively. Hopefully the Bank’s new management will provide the incentives to get Bank operations to address gender gaps.

5. Other Initiatives Advancing the World Bank Gender Strategy

5.1. Gender Anchor Initiatives

Since the Strategy appeared, the anchor decided to emphasize three initiatives to advance Strategy implementation. All of these initiatives, addressing weaknesses this Study identified, are needed and welcome:

- A publicity campaign to disseminate information about gender. Given the lack of awareness about the Strategy and the role of gender exhibited by Bank non-gender experts in our spot interviews, this initiative is badly needed. It seems like few non-gender experts have looked at the 8,000 Strategy copies that the gender anchor disseminated.
- Empowering gender focal points by helping them establish a communication network. Focal points, found to be performing very inconsistently, could benefit through a communication network. The Study authors did not hear details about this planned network but hope it would function as an Advisory service and information exchange. This format has benefited several Bank networks following the lead of the stellar Bank Education Advisory Service. Gender Action believes that a communications network can be a powerful tool for sharing information. However, empowering weak gender focal points requires much more than a communications network. To be effective, the focal points need to become gender experts who devote full time to engendering Bank projects in their countries.

- Engendering core Economic and Sector Work (ESW) including Public Expenditure Reviews, Poverty Assessments, Development Process Reviews, Country Economic Memoranda and financial reports. Previous analyses as well as this Study illustrate why core Economic and Sector Work need engendering (Zuckerman 2000b). The following paragraph from a gender analysis of Public Expenditure Reviews (PERs) contained in the Bank's first paper analyzing Bank macroeconomic policies and gender illustrates this point:

“PERs are Bank analyses which aim to make transparent to client countries and the Bank what the Government spends on, what it should spend on and where the resources would come from. PERs begin with a macroeconomic analysis followed by specific sector analyses. PER macroeconomic analyses tend to be devoid of people let alone gender concerns. Recent PERs have expanded their macroeconomic focus to include governance, corruption and accountability issues but there is still little or no mention of people. All PERs focus on poverty and equity and a few mention gender considerations in the chapters devoted to education, health, population and occasionally agriculture or other sectors. But PERs reviewed make no macroeconomic and gender linkages in their macroeconomic sections. It is recommended that PERs integrate gender considerations into their macroeconomic as well as microeconomic analyses to determine differential gender impacts.” (Zuckerman 2000b).

Following several unsuccessful EAP efforts to provide gender inputs into PERs, the region invited the gender anchor to provide assistance in integrating gender into the Cambodia PER. The anchor sent a gender economist to Cambodia who provided assistance. As a result, the Cambodia PER integrates gender into various places and gender is being addressed in country budget work and civil service reform initiatives.

The SAR gender coordinator lamented that sometimes gender inputs for Public Expenditure Reviews do not get reflected in the final PER due to "space constraints" because "gender is the first item to get cut".

5.2. GENFUND

One initiative outside the Strategy worth mentioning is the GENFUND that promotes Strategy targets (World Bank 2005b). In 2001, Norway established a Trust Fund for Gender Mainstreaming (GENFUND) that is now entering its fifth year of operation. Initially, Norway allocated about US\$0.5 million to GENFUND each year. Since the third year, The Netherlands contributed a matching amount, raising the fund total to roughly US\$1 million. Project task managers are invited to submit proposals to compete for funding up to a maximum of US\$50,000. The funding must be used expressly to finance innovative project gender mainstreaming, providing good practice examples. In the 2004 round, GENFUND funded 23 projects selected from 84 proposals, of which 38 percent were in the Africa region. African countries are likely to continue to benefit disproportionately

from the GENFUND. The bulk of GENDFUNDS have supported engendering health including HIV/AIDS; capacity building; and economic policy initiatives. Several GENFUND grants have targeted engendering Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers (PRSPs) discussed in 4.21.⁴⁶

5.3. Some Regional Initiatives

Africa

Since the Strategy appeared, the Africa regional gender coordinator produced the freestanding Africa Region Gender Strategy (ARGS) and Work Programs for fiscal years 2003-04 and 2004-05 that are available on the regional gender webpages (World Bank 2002c). AFR gender staff disseminated the ARGS in the region in late 2002, inviting feedback from regional network heads, country directors, and the Regional Leadership Team. ARGS argues that the “business case” for gender that the Strategy promotes needs to be translated into systematic integration of gender into regional operations and greater accountability by managers and staff. It focuses on engendering the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) and proposes strengthening Country Office gender focal points. It promotes four “entry points”: 1) “Gender and HIV-AIDS”; 2) “Gender and Poverty”; 3) “Engendering Economic Policy” (including integrating gender analysis and gender responsive budgeting into Public Expenditure Reviews and PRSPs); and 4) “Gender and Law”. ARGS hopes the Africa region will move toward systematizing gender in operational work but emphasizes that the commitment of Country Directors must be strengthened to realize this goal. ARGS provides a good model of how regional network teams can mainstream gender in their work. Prior to the Strategy, AFR produced some valuable gender research analyzing the linkages between gender, growth, poverty and adjustment (Annex 4).

East Asia and Pacific

Before the Strategy appeared, EAP in 2000 had already produced a regional gender strategy. With a strong Thailand-based Gender Coordinator and another strong headquarters-based HDN economist representing the region on the Gender and Development Board, EAP is well-positioned to advance women’s empowerment in Bank projects. The Coordinator took the initiative to talk with each Country Director to identify possible projects for engendering. EAP’s Vice President convened a meeting with country gender coordinators and Directors to discuss gender. The headquarters EAP Gender Board representative, who co-authored “Engendering Development” (World Bank 2001a), is promoting a strong regional gender research agenda intended to focus on labor market issues, trafficking problems and developing gender monitoring indicators that all Bank task managers and other staff could use.

⁴⁶ Engendering PRSPs is one of Gender Action’s key programs because of PRSPs’ critical role in shaping country investment priorities.

Eastern Europe and Central Asia

In 2002 ECA published “Gender in Transition” (Paci 2002), a sweeping regional survey and analysis of the most pressing regional gender gaps and problems. They include post-socialist gender issues such as female disadvantages in the labor market, the gender implications of pension reforms, gender gaps in education and health, accelerating trafficking in women and children and violence against women. The ECA gender coordinator underlined that the Bank Gender Strategy presents typical gender issues and solutions that are not a strong fit for ECA’s unique problems.

Middle East and North Africa

Gender is one of five areas of strategic focus in the MENA region.⁴⁷ MENA prepared a Regional Gender Report timed for distribution at the World Bank-International Monetary Fund Annual Meeting in Dubai in September 2003. It has expanded its country-based gender focal points and garnered the regional chief economist’s support to tackle the region’s high women’s illiteracy and low employment rates (Annex 5).

South Asia

Gender has been integral to many operations in several SAR countries. A case in point is Sri Lanka. SAR’s post-conflict reconstruction and tsunami reconstruction projects in Sri Lanka constitute Bank best-practice cases in empowering women (Greenberg and Zuckerman).⁴⁸

6. Conclusions and Recommendations

A historical retrospective since the early 1970s when women in development and gender were not yet on the World Bank’s radar screen suggests that substantial progress has been made in making gender a Bank priority. The Gender Strategy publication and dissemination indicate further progress.

However, the World Bank’s mere \$600,000 one-year Incentive Fund for Gender Mainstreaming to facilitate Strategy implementation during fiscal year 2002, the first year of the existence of the Gender Strategy, reflects the low position gender commands among Bank priorities. Gender today is one of many Bank priorities. Other Bank priorities have stronger mandates than does gender. What is worse: The Strategy does not establish a plan to provide resources needed to engender operations.

⁴⁷ MENA’s four other areas of strategic focus are: water, education, private sector development and public sector reform.

⁴⁸ WIDER will publish a Gender Action paper on “The Gender Dimensions of Post-Conflict Reconstruction” (PCR) that demonstrates the Bank’s success in engendering Sri Lankan PCR projects.

The latest Gender and Development OP and BP definitely improve on the preceding policy but they perpetuate an unfunded non-mandated Gender Strategy.

While the Bank has made significant progress over the years in embracing the value of gender, it remains mainly rhetorical because of insufficient funding to expand the number of gender experts and to promote women's empowerment and gender equality in investments.

Obstacles to achieving Bank progress on gender issues include:

The Bank has too few gender experts. Many of the gender focal points who compose the majority of gender “experts” tend to be weak gender advocates.

Overall, there are two distinct camps on gender in the Bank. In one small camp are those working on gender and a few other gender advocates who are familiar with the Gender Strategy. The other very large camp consists of the majority of Bank staff who are unaware of the Strategy and among whom few promote gender equality objectives. The vast majority of Bank staff do not actively promote gender equality in their work.

This was the conclusion from our interviews that corroborate years of discussions by the lead author with Bank staff working across sectors around the world. Moreover, several regional gender coordinators estimated that probably less than five percent of their regions' economists had glanced at the Strategy.

The Strategy is premised on the assumption that with the preparation of Country Gender Assessments (CGAs), analytical and lending instruments will address gender issues. But this sequence is not unfolding because the assumption ignores the consistent Bank track record of staff responding, albeit minimally, to mandatory incentives such as the required environmental Safeguard Policies and ignoring non-mandated and voluntary policies like gender's to accelerate Board project approval. The Bank Safeguard Policies do not include the non-mandated gender policies.

CGAs run the risk of being ignored in project preparation and especially in implementation as have many poverty and environmental assessments (Rich 2002). CGAs provide important analyses of country gender gaps that projects should address, but the Bank must ensure that staff persons have incentives to integrate CGA content into operations.

Analysis of a representative sample of Bank analytical work, operations and the CAS in our case study of China, the Bank's largest client, indicate that none of these products seriously recognize nor address gender gaps despite the timely availability of the China Country Gender Review that is supposed to feed into the CAS and operations. Especially for operations, this is a pattern across countries in most sectors.

The main Strategy goal of preparing CGAs can be achieved, although the Strategy deadline of every client country having a CGA is unlikely to be met.

Moreover, CGAs will vary in quality depending on resources. However, the potential for translating the inconsistent CGAs into Bank investments is another challenge. **The proof of Strategy effectiveness will be an engendered Bank investment portfolio that promotes women's rights and gender equality.** So far, too few resources are allocated to engendering large operations outside of the health and education sectors. Even health and education operations primarily address reproductive health and girls' education, by definition "gender issues," but tend to neglect broader issues concerning gender differentiated access to and types of health care and gender stereotyped school curricula.

Most structural adjustment operations continue to neglect gendered impacts, increasing poor women's already onerous home care burden, for example, shifting to them the additional tasks of caring for sick family members who previously used health care facilities that adjustment privatized and made unaffordable. A myriad of painful ramifications ensuing from adjustment program job retrenchment typically hurt women more than men: women are the first to be laid off and the last to be rehired. Moreover, women and children deeply share the consequences when husbands/fathers lose employment (Vladislavjevic and Zuckerman 2004).

This Study concludes that the Gender Strategy has the following strengths and weaknesses:

Strategy strengths are that it:

- **Systematizes previously ad hoc best practices**, especially preparing Country Gender Assessments.
- **Presents the "business case" for gender**, based on the argument that gender inequalities limit economic growth.
- **Creates a centralized/decentralized monitoring and reporting system** that feeds into a unified Bank sector monitoring review.
- **Encourages Bank gender advocates to launch new gender initiatives.**
- **Provides a short-term impetus for senior managers to embrace and promote gender concerns.** A key determinant of the Strategy's potential success will be political commitment by Bank senior managers. According to Bank staff interviewed in early 2005, there has been recent backsliding on gender. The attempt to close the gender anchor in late 2004 is an example. Without the gender anchor, "gender mainstreaming" would have fizzled into oblivion because the majority of Bank staff lack incentives to identify and address gender gaps.
- **Augments the arsenal of tools for Bank gender advocacy.**

Strategy weaknesses are that it:

- **Lacks mandates to require Bank staff to become familiar with or embrace its core message to promote gender equality.** Despite

strong Strategy dissemination efforts, only a minority of managers and staff have read the Strategy and many are unaware of its existence. Similarly, very few Bank non-gender experts have looked at any Bank gender web pages.

- **Lacks a more meaningful accountability mechanism than the new Strategy implementation monitoring system** – a short gender summary in a Bank-wide sector monitoring report. Instead, the Bank should track the gendered impacts and benefits of a large sample of every type of Bank investment, policy and strategy
- **Expects CGAs will translate into engendering operations but without incentives and sanctions**, it is likely that many staff and managers will not engender Bank investments.
- **Depends on Country Directors who control Bank funds to allocate resources to address gender gaps** but Country Directors allocate funding for mandated issues first and then distribute additional resources, if any, for only a fraction of many competing claims including gender.
- **Gives women’s rights much less weight than the economic “business case,”** because the Bank lacks a mandate to promote human rights (Quinones 2004).
- **Addresses macroeconomic policies weakly** despite the Bank’s deep role in influencing country macroeconomic policy and financing structural adjustment programs – including Poverty Reduction and Development Policy Support Credits – that contain “conditionalities” and/or other macroeconomic reforms having particularly harmful effects on poor women.

To ensure **Strategy effectiveness**, this Study recommends that the Bank:

- **Mandate addressing gender gaps and issues in all Bank activities.** Without mandates, Bank staff lack incentives to address gender issues. Mandates made a difference for the environment. The lack of mandates is equivalent to applying a set of brakes on Strategy implementation.
- Expand the number of gender experts significantly.
- **Place gender experts strategically in all networks** in order to meet the Strategy goal of mainstreaming gender into all Bank activities.
- **Mandate gender-sensitization training for all staff** so they understand how they cannot fulfill the Bank’s poverty-reduction mission without identifying and addressing gender gaps.
- **Locate empowered gender experts in each Bank country office** and charge them with engendering every operation from identification and design through implementation and ensuring that Bank investments address key country gender problems such as trafficking in poor vulnerable women and girls.

- **Incorporate gender rigorously into the Quality Assurance Group Supervision questionnaires** as it is doing to other QAG questionnaires.
- **Accelerate engendering non-gender Operational Policies** that are very influential in the Bank project cycle.
- **Invite Gender and Development Board and gender anchor staff to participate routinely in all, not just some, Bank activities** including drafting all new Bank policies and approaches because gender is a cross-cutting issue as the Strategy underlines. The Bank's own gender anchor, not civil society organizations like Gender Action, should provide the first gender inputs into new Bank approaches (see example in footnote 13).
- **Arrange for all the regions to present their gender activities and research on the Bank external website** and enhance gender linkages among web pages to potentially expose more stakeholders to gender needs and tools.
- **Create real accountability mechanisms beyond the new internal monitoring reporting system** by tracking the gendered impacts and benefits of a large sample of every type of Bank investment, policy and strategy.
- **Advocate strongly to eliminate all Bank macro- and microeconomic conditionalities and debt** that have harmful gendered impacts and deepen poverty. Only by eliminating these conditionalities can the recommended gender measures have a meaningful impact.

The current World Bank managerial transition offers an opportunity for the Bank to undertake these recommendations. The new management should consider updating or replacing the current strategy with a new one that contains mandates and promises funding to expand the number of Bank experts and address gender issues and gaps throughout Bank operations. The new management must end policy conditionalities and eliminate debt that harm poor men and women. This is what the Bank's managers and staff must do to promote gender equality and reduce poverty worldwide.

References

- Association for Women's Right in Development (AWID). 2002. The World Bank and Women's Rights in Development. Facts & Issues No. 5, October 2002.
- Association for Women's Right in Development (AWID). 2003. How Can Gender Equality be Promoted at the World Bank? An Interview with Carolyn Long. Resource Net Friday File. Issue 124, May 2, 2003.
- Blackden, Mark and Bhanu, Chitra. 1999. Gender, Growth and Poverty Reduction. Special Program of Assistance for Africa, 1998 Status Report on Poverty in Sub-Saharan Africa. World Bank. Washington, DC.
- Blackden, Mark and Elizabeth Morris Hughes. 1993. "Paradigm Postponed: Gender and Economic Adjustment in Sub-Saharan Africa." World Bank, Washington, D.C.
- Cunningham, Wendy. 1999a. "The Substitution of Non-Market Work Among Household Members." LCSPR. World Bank, Washington, D.C.
- Cunningham, Wendy. 1999b. "Feminization of the Informal Sector in LAC". LCSPR. World Bank, Washington, D.C.
- Cunningham, Wendy. 1998. "Breadwinner Vs. Caregiver: Labor Force Patterns of Household Heads Over the Mexican Business Cycle." LCSPR. World Bank, Washington, D.C.
- Detjen, J. 1999. "Integrating Gender in Public Sector Modernization." LCSPR. World Bank, Washington, D.C.
- Greenberg, Marcia E. and Elaine Zuckerman. 2005. The Gender Dimensions of Post-Conflict Reconstruction: The Challenges in Development Aid. WIDER. 2005. Forthcoming.
- Long, Carolyn. 2003. The Advocate's Guide to Promoting Gender Equality at the World Bank. Women's Edge.
- Operations Evaluation Department (OED). 2000. "Integrating Gender in World Bank Assistance." World Bank. Washington, DC.
- Paci, Pierella. 2002. Gender in Transition. World Bank Eastern Europe and Central Asia Region.
- PREMGE. 1999. "Gender in the FY98-FY99 CAS Retrospective Review." World Bank draft mimeograph.
- Quinones, Adriana. 2004. Gender and Post-Conflict Reconstruction: The World Bank Track Record. Event Summary Report, Heinrich Böll Foundation. Available at: www.genderaction.org.
- Rich, Bruce. 1994. Mortgaging the Earth: The World Bank, Environmental Impoverishment, and the Crisis of Development. Beacon Press.

Rich, Bruce. 2002. "The World Bank Under James Wolfensohn." Chapter 2 in Jonathan Pincus and Jeffrey Winters, eds, *Reinventing the World Bank*. Cornell University Press.

Royaume du Maroc. 1999. *Morocco Gender Plan of Action*. Morocco.

Scott, Roxanne. 2002. Strategy for Mainstreaming Gender in World Bank Institute Programs. World Bank draft mimeograph.

South Asia Region (SAR). 2002. Global Public Goods Incentive Fund for Gender Mainstreaming. FY02 Progress Report.

Tinker, Irene. 1990. *Persistent Inequalities: Women and World Development*. New York. Oxford University Press.

Vladisavljevic, Aleksandra, and Elaine Zuckerman. 2004. Structural Adjustment's Gendered Impacts: the Case of Serbia and Montenegro. Gender Action. Available at: www.genderaction.org.

World Bank. 2001a. *Engendering Development: Through Gender Equality in Rights, Resources, and Voice*. Policy Research Report. Oxford University Press. Summary available at www.worldbank.org/gender/prr.

World Bank. 2001b. *Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper Sourcebook*. Available in English, Spanish, French and Russian at www.worldbank.org/poverty/strategies.

World Bank. 2002a. *Integrating Gender into the World Bank's Work: A Strategy for Action*. Available at www.worldbank.org/gender/overview/sps/home.htm.

World Bank. 2002b. *China: Country Gender Review*.
Chinese version: www.worldbank.org.cn/Chinese/content/gender-cn.pdf.
English version: www.worldbank.org.cn/English/content/gender-en.pdf.

World Bank. 2002c. *Africa Region Gender Strategy & FY03-04 Work Program*. Gender Team Poverty Reduction and Economic Management Africa Region.

World Bank. 2003a. *Memorandum of the President of the International Bank for Reconstruction and Development and the International Finance Corporation to the Executive Directors on a Country Assistance Strategy of the World Bank Group for the People's Republic of China*.

World Bank. 2003b. *Operational Manual. Operational Policy 4.20. Gender and Development*. Available at: <http://wbln0018.worldbank.org/institutional/manuals/opmanual/nsf/Opolw?OpenView>.

World Bank. 2003c. *Operational Manual. Bank Procedure 4.20. Gender and Development*. Available at: <http://wbln0018.worldbank.org/institutional/manuals/opmanual.nsf/Bprow?OpenView>.

World Bank. 2003d. *Country Assistance Strategies: Retrospective and Future Directions*. Discussion Draft for the March 26, 2003 Committee on Development Effectiveness.

World Bank. 2003e. Gender Equality and the Millennium Development Goals. Gender and Development Group. Available at: www.worldbank.org/gender/gendermdg.pdf.

World Bank. 2005a.

<http://web.worldbank.org/WBSITE/EXTERNAL/WBI/0,,contentMDK:20097853~menuPK:204763~pagePK:209023~piPK:207535~theSitePK:213799,00.html>

World Bank 2005b. Integrating Gender Into the World Bank's Work: The Role of the Norwegian-Dutch Trust Fund for Gender Mainstreaming.

<http://siteresources.worldbank.org/INTGENDER/News%20and%20Events/20331680/GenFundBrochure.pdf>

Zuckerman, Elaine and Ashley Garrett. 2003. Do Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers Address Gender Issues? A Gender Audit of 2002 PRSPs. Gender Action. Available at: www.genderaction.org.

Zuckerman, Elaine. 2000a. Country Gender Review Guidelines: World Bank. Draft.

Zuckerman, Elaine. 2000b. Macroeconomic Policies and Gender in the World Bank. Background paper for Integrating Gender into the World Bank's Work: A Strategy for Action.

Zuckerman, Elaine. 2001. Study of the Role, Functions and Impact of the World Bank's Quality Assurance Group (QAG) and Financial Management/ Loan Administration Policies and Procedures. Internal IDB Document. December 2001.

Zuckerman, Elaine. 2002a. A Primer on Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers and Gender. Gender Action. Available at: www.genderaction.org.

Zuckerman, Elaine. 2002b. 'Engendering' Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers (PRSPs): the issues and the challenges. Gender and Development, An Oxfam Journal, Volume 10, Number 3, 2002, Oxford. Available at: www.genderaction.org.

Zuckerman, Elaine. 2002c. Evaluation of Gender Mainstreaming in Advocacy Work on Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers (PRSPs). Paper prepared for Oxfam, Great Britain. Available at: www.genderaction.org

Annexes

Annex 1

Persons Interviewed For First Printing

Name	Institution/Position
	WORLD BANK GENDER EXPERTS
Blackden, Mark	Gender Coordinator, AFR
Chamlou, Nadereh	Gender Coordinator, MENA
Fort, Lucia	Gender Expert, Gender and Development Group
Hooper, Emma	Former Acting Gender Coordinator, Consultant, SAR
King, Beth	Gender Co-Coordinator, EAP
Mason, Karen	Director, Gender and Development Group, Gender Board
Paci, Pierella	Gender Coordinator, ECA
Scott, Roxanne	Gender Expert, Consultant, WBI
Tornquist, Annika	Gender Expert, Consultant, LAC Gender Unit
Van den Oever, Pietronella	CESI Group, WBI
	FORMER WORLD BANK GENDER EXPERT
Herz, Barbara	Former WID Unit Chief, World Bank
	WORLD BANK NON-GENDER EXPERTS
	<i>Note: Bank non-gender experts' names were removed to encourage them to provide frank answers.⁴⁹</i>
Anonymous	Country Director, MENA
Anonymous	Sector Director, MENA
Anonymous	Task Manager, ECA
Anonymous	Senior Auditor, Internal Audit Department; Former Regional Task Manager and Economist, SAR
Anonymous	Agricultural Economist, EAP
Anonymous	Lead Sanitary Engineer, AFR
Anonymous	Chief Country Economist, Country Office, SAR

⁴⁹ To authenticate legitimacy, Gender Action shared the non-gender experts' names with the Heinrich Boell Foundation that retains their confidentiality.

Annex 2

Interview Questions for Gender-Expert World Bank Staff

Note: Interviews are a dynamic process so any of the questions below spawned others and interviewees often volunteered information outside the lists below. Some interview questions have a Gender Board, other a regional focus.

Are you or who is your regional gender coordinator?
To which network does your regional gender coordinator belong?
To whom does your regional gender coordinator report?

How is the regional gender focal points system working? How many regional country offices have the regional gender focal points?

What new gender policies, projects, ESW or other initiatives have been developed in your region or Bankwide since the Strategy approval?

Do you think all or some of Bank managers and staff aware of the new Strategy?
How do Bank staff and managers interpret the Strategy?
How do they perceive it affects their work?
The 2000 Bank macro policy and gender study concluded that many Bank staff persons were confused about the meaning of gender and gender mainstreaming (Zuckerman 2000b). Has the Strategy changed or is it changing that?
What do you perceive as Strategy strengths and weaknesses?

How are the Strategy's explicit targets being met?

1) Year One:

- Produce of annual gender mainstreaming progress reports by Regional Vice Presidents and the Gender Board
- Create the first template/adaptable tool to help staff integrate gender into work
- Generate a database on where to acquire gender expertise
- Prepare new Operational Policy and Bank Procedures statements on gender and development
- Ensure adequate staff resources for fully implementing the strategy are available
- Provide incentive funding: Amount and for what?
- Develop and implement a new gender monitoring and evaluation system

2) Ongoing:

- Integrate gender into WBI courses
- Enhance engendering tools on the Bank's website
- Provide incentive funding
- Enhance and continue collaboration with civil society, other donors, and the UN system

3) What foundations has the Bank laid and what progress has it achieved toward meeting longer term targets?

- Prepare Country Gender Assessments: Which countries and what kind of CGAs given past range? What do they include? Bank portfolio reviews? Key gender gaps? Donor reviews? Literature reviews? Statistics etc.? How were they prepared? Participatory? Fieldwork? Other?
- Mainstream gender into PRSPs, JSAs, CASs, sector strategy papers, quality assurance assessments
- Create a series of technical modules for training staff and clients on gender issues
- Develop informal learning events
- Incorporate gender dimensions into other operational policies

4) Responsibilities of Regional Vice Presidents:

- Provide pro-active leadership on integrating gender mainstreaming within region
- Approve, update and ensure implementation of regional gender action plans and production of regional annual gender mainstreaming progress report
- Hold Country Directors accountable for timely CGA completion, for integrating findings in a timely way into country dialogue and the CAS
- Hold Sector Directors/Managers accountable for integrating gender issues into sector strategies, programs and projects in priority sectors and issues identified in CGA
- Ensure JSAs pay adequate attention to gender issues
- Ensure Country Directors have adequate resources to assist regional staff with gender mainstreaming

Annex 3

Interview Questions for World Bank Non Gender-Experts

Where are you working in the Bank?

Have you heard of the Bank Gender Strategy the Board endorsed in 2001?

If so:

- Have you read it?
- Are you aware of its contents?
- Has it influenced or changed your work in any way?
- What do you perceive as its strengths and weaknesses?
- Do you have resources to implement the gender Strategy?
- Do you have any incentive to implement it?

Do you think all or some of Bank managers and staff who are not gender experts are aware of the new Strategy and if so, has it affected their work?

Do you ever look at the Bank's gender websites?

Have you considered the meaning of gender and gender mainstreaming?
If so, do your Bank activities mainstream or integrate gender issues and if so how?

Do you know who your regional gender coordinator is?

Have you had any gender training?

Annex 4

Good Practice Examples of World Bank Gender and Macroeconomic Research

Quoted from Zuckerman 2000b:

Africa (AFR):

"The Africa region has produced important ESW analyzing the linkages between gender, growth, poverty and adjustment (Blackden and Bhanu 1999; Blackden and Morris-Hughes 1993).⁵⁰ This research combines macromodeling and microeconomic gender analysis of household survey data to demonstrate that reducing gender inequalities enhances growth, efficiency and welfare. It recommends policy actions to increase macroeconomic growth through microeconomic interventions like investing in labor-savings techniques to reduce SSA women's onerous work burden and enhance access of poor women and men to assets and production techniques."

Latin American and the Caribbean (LAC):

"The LAC gender team has initiated a substantial body of analytical work examining the impact of adjustment measures like privatization and trade liberalization on men's and women's welfare and employment patterns (Cunningham 1998, 1999a and 1999b; Detjen 1999).⁵¹ It examines the extent to which men and women in recession and adjustment leave school, lose jobs and find new employment where. The research is based on household surveys and focus groups following people over one to two years. LAC ESW demonstrates that without an unemployment insurance safety net protecting retrenched men

⁵⁰ The papers referenced are a sample of ongoing and completed analysis linking macroeconomic policy, adjustment and gender. For a complete list, contact Mark Blackden who coordinates AFR gender work, mblackden@worldbank.org.

⁵¹ The papers referenced are a sample of ongoing and completed LAC ESW linking macroeconomic policy, adjustment and gender. For a complete list, contact Wendy Cunningham who coordinates LAC analytic work, wcunningham@worldbank.org.

during privatization, former housewives are forced to join the labor market. In tandem, trade liberalization and globalization are also drawing women into the labor market, especially in export assembly manufacturing and in services. As this employment shift occurs, there is evidence in some LAC countries of men increasing their contribution to housework and childcare.”

Annex 5

Select Gender Indicators

	Female % of Labor Force	% Female Illiteracy	% Male Illiteracy	Total Fertility Rate – Births per Woman	Female Life Expectancy at Birth	Male Life Expectancy at Birth
EAP	45	14	10	2.1	71	68
ECA	47	4	2	1.6	73	64
LAC	36	12	14	2.4	74	68
MENA	29	39	18	3.1	70	67
SAR	34	56	27	3.1	64	62
SSA	42	42	29	5.2	46	45

Source: World Bank World Development Indicators, 2005

Annex 6

World Bank Internet Web Pages on Gender

(www.worldbank.org/gender)

Compiled by Hilary Sims Feldstein

WORLD BANK GENDER AND DEVELOPMENT WEBPAGE

(Formerly known as Gen Net, as of January 2005)

<p><i>Strategy</i></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Gender Mainstreaming Strategy Paper 2002</i> • <i>OP/BP 4.20, Gender and Development</i> • <i>Annual Gender Monitoring Reports (monitoring reports re strategy for FY02, FY03)</i> • <i>OED Gender Evaluations</i> • <i>Report on Engendering Development</i> 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>This click takes the viewer directly to the Gender Mainstreaming paper and to monitoring reports for 2002 and 2003.</i> • <i>OP/BP provides specific guidance on gender assessments and gives the country director responsibility for its incorporation into country dialogue and Country Assistance Strategy.</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ <i>Under the general section on technical assistance in the OP/BP document (OP, BP and GP8.4), gender (and other specific areas) is not discussed, though it does say that when TA is given, borrower is expected to implement the recommendations of such studies.</i> ○ <i>There is no reference in the poverty reduction section (OP1.0) to gender analysis.</i> ○ <i>Nor is gender listed among the 23 listed categories (e.g. environment, transportation, urban development) that are covered in an Annex to the Country Assistance Strategies (Summary of Economic and Social Work). Perhaps in the gender sections of the OP/BP, it could be explicitly stated that it be included in all/any of the summaries called for in BP 2.11 Annex A3 (last revised in 1995)</i> • <i>The Annual Gender Monitoring Reports did not respond to my click.</i> • <i>The OED Gender Evaluations includes chapters on four regional workshops assessing gender and development issues in each region. As well, there is a section on 'Social Inclusion: Gender and Indigenous Tribal People's Issues.'</i>
<p><i>Regional Gender Web sites</i></p>	<p><i>Access is provided to four regional websites: Africa, Europe & Central Asia, Latin America & Caribbean, and Middle East & North Africa</i></p>	<p><i>These are discussed under regional section. East Asia and the Pacific and South Asia do not have links to the websites</i></p>
<p><i>Analytical Tools (replaces Resources/Tools)</i></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Statistical Indicators and Databases.</i> • <i>Gender and Social Assessments/Analyses</i> • <i>PRSPs</i> 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Statistical Indicators and Databases leads to the Gender Stats site with a variety of ways to look at gender stats as well as access to 29 other databases including those from the UN, WB funded or conducted, US, regional, and a set on Gender, Law and Policy.</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ <i>Summary Gender Profile</i>

Reforming the World Bank: Will the Gender Strategy Make a Difference?

<p><i>Analytical Tools cont.</i></p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ <i>Thematic Data (including Poverty (Capabilities & Human Capital, etc., see Annex A)</i> ● <i>Comment: Introductory text to this section states: "Although gender is a key component of social assessment, gender issues are not always fully addressed in the majority of SAs...When undertaking SA, the Bank does not consider it mandatory to gather gender-disaggregated data and to develop specific recommendations for women and men in the given context." However, one of the listed tools is "Ways to Integrate Gender into Social Assessment Tools"</i> ● <i>Gender in Social Analysis/Assessments lists eight entries of which five are descriptions of social assessment methods and three are exemplary case studies. Under another heading (Social Analysis/Assessments Overview).</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ <i>All the documents are WB documents.</i> ○ <i>Social Analysis (Assessment) Overview lists four documents: Social Analysis Website, Social Analysis Sourcebook, SDStats (Social Development Indicators Database, currently only available to WBG staff), and Country/Macro Social Analysis (currently not available, though sample is given)</i> ● <i>PRSPs clicks to a summary of the gender chapter of the Poverty Reduction Strategies. It emphasizes that the conventional poverty research and analysis tools are adequate for assessing gender; what is needed is the will to use them, what is needed is to ask the right questions and provide evidence to policy makers and planners of the importance of gender as a key development issue. The site provides links to the full chapter (No. 10) on gender and PSRPs in English, French, Russian, and Spanish as well as links to related WB websites.</i>
<p><i>Operational Work</i></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● <i>Statistical Indicators and Databases (as above)</i> ● <i>Promising Approaches to Endgendering Development: a set of seven examples of good practice</i> ● <i>Tools for Specific Sectors are cited under 12 categories from Agriculture and Rural Development (6 documents) to Water Supply and Sanitation</i> 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ <i>Comment on Tools for Specific Sectors:</i> ● <i>Of the six documents in Ag, only one opened up (that to a WB site).</i> ● <i>Two of the other sites were listed with PDF, but trying to get hooked to them was met with a statement that it had timed out with respect to getting on the WB intranet. Both of these are published WB documents (1996), though I could not find them on any of the WB publications lists.</i> ● <i>The usefulness of clicking on any of the topics varied considerably. None of those under 'Water and Sanitation' was available.</i> ● <i>'Trade' was a lively site with seven papers available (all Bank papers) as abstracts with links to the full paper. However, the Summary of Issues on the Impact of Trade..Gender Equality PREM Note 86, could not be brought up at this site. Starting with the PREM site and clicking on this title brought up again the note that emerges when one presses 'Trade'.</i> ● <i>Clicking on Social Protection brings up an abstract and a list of 8 obtainable WB papers.</i>
<p><i>Capacity Building</i></p>	<p><i>This section draws from training programs for WB staff and partners and</i></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● <i>Information and Communication Technologies and Gender includes a link to a Gender and Law Conference held in March 2003 with videos of the sessions.</i>

Capacity Building cont.	<p>includes a list of training events with links to available training materials from these events</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Information & Communication, Technologies and Gender Celebration of Diversity, March 2004 MDG Workshop Videos on gender issues by B span 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Celebration of Diversity, March 2004 did not come up. MDG workshop was held in November 2003 and is on line with video. Videos came up but viewing them requires access to Real Player or the like (ads for which emerged).
Documents and Reports	This replaces Bank Publications	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 8 publications are listed In Other Reports of ten publications on offer were listed as PDF available, in only six cases did the actual publication surface. For those that didn't 'the operation timed out when attempting to contact'
External partnerships and links	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> External Gender Consultative Group (EGCG) Gateway Gender Portal Gateway Gender Portal Other External Links 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> EGCG lists members and meeting reports Other External Links subdivides into: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> United Nations Agencies Bilateral organizations <p>And in all cases goes straight to the gender site of that agency.</p>
Comments	<p>The World Bank Gender Website in 2005 is very similar to the 2003 version, but there are a few differences. There appears to be more material, with access to the documents, on World Bank operations and procedures, i.e. giving the exact wording of various guidelines. There are more analytical tools provided. There are links to a wide number of projects on both versions. There were many more links to external sites.</p>	

EUROPE & CENTRAL ASIA GENDER SITE

Gender Issues in Transition Countries		The opening page of the ECA site states nine bulleted 'Gender Issues in Transition Countries'
Gender Issues in ECA	Located on the sidebar	Provides access to 11 one page statements about each issue. The issues are: Does Gender Matter? The Special Case Of Transition Countries; Access To Economic Opportunities; The Loss Of Special Benefits For Women; Gender In Education; Men's Health; Maternal And Child Health; Falling Fertility Rates; Vulnerability Of Women; Juvenile Crime And Delinquency; Key Areas For Action
Profiles	Country profiles	One page of statistical data plus one page on gender issues for: Armenia, Azerbaijan, Georgia, Kyrgyz Republic, Moldova, Tajikistan, and Uzbekistan.
Other		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Regional Gender Data: For each country there is one page of statistical data based on GenderStats Publications & Video Publications: this page contains links to four WB publications, two specific to the region, one on Gender Equality and Millennium Development Goals; and one a link to the broader WB gender documents in the Documents section

Reforming the World Bank: Will the Gender Strategy Make a Difference?

<i>Other cont.</i>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Contacts: list of WB Gender contacts in HQ and in each country</i> • <i>Related Links: to the four other WB Gender websites, and to three UN sites—UNDP, UN Women's Watch, and UNDP/UNECE Gender Statistics Website for Europe and North America</i> • <i>Events: this was blank</i>
<i>Comments</i>	<p><i>There was no separate site in 2003. What there was, I guess on the ECA site, had much less focus with topics only on: post conflict, youth, social development, and institutions. This version is much more focused and informative.</i></p>	

MIDDLE EAST & NORTH AFRICA GENDER SITE

<p><i>Note: The bulk of the page is taken up with a brief on gender and development in the MENA Region. A column on the left provides links to all other work as shown below.</i></p>		
<i>Overview</i>		<p><i>The first half of the text of this article on closing gaps in education and health, economic participation, and political participation is the main story on the page. When clicking to the whole report, it discusses WB programs in the region. It also shows a neat diagram comparing male and female progress since 1970 on adult illiteracy rates, life expectancy, LFPR (?), Primary enrollment, and Secondary enrollment</i></p>
<i>Gender and Development in the Middle East and North Africa</i>		<p><i>This is the paper from which the brief is drawn, is reached by a click and available in English or Arabic.</i></p>
<i>Workshop on Gender Equality and MDG</i>	<i>B-span event.</i>	<p><i>Available as video, a link to the MDG workshop site.</i></p>
<i>Activities</i> <i>Activities cont.</i>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>MNA Consultative Council on Gender</i> • <i>Access to Basic Services through Registration. A story about a proposal for a program in Egypt providing women with identity cards. The proposal is a Development Market Place Competition finalist</i> • <i>Cultural Expression and Poverty Reduction</i> • <i>Work in Progress</i> • <i>Promoting Gender Awareness among World Bank staff</i> • <i>Statistics (for each country)</i> • <i>Related MNA Sectors: Economic Policy, Poverty, Public Sector, Social Development, Health, and Education. For each sector page, there is a brief on the issue for MNA, links to the full paper, links to specific WB publications, links to related MNA sectors, and related WB sectors.</i>
<i>Comments</i>	<p><i>Much of the site is the same as in 2003. There is for each of the 5 MNA sectors, a sector page on the gender site with a brief for the gender issues on the sector, links to the full paper, links to other useful information all WB materials.</i></p>	

AFRICA REGION GENDER SITE

<i>Regional Gender Strategy</i>		<i>This clicks directly to a PDF file of the Africa Region Gender Strategy and FY04-05 Work Program with considerable detail.</i>
<i>Strategic Country Gender Assessments</i>		<i>There are 10 Country assessments: Benin, Burkina Faso, Ghana, Guinea, Kenya, Malawi, Sao Tome, Tanzania, Uganda, and Zambia. Generally tightly focused on women's roles and gender differences as well as the Bank's current programs.</i>
<i>Country Resources</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Country Contact Base</i> • <i>Country Summaries of Gender Findings</i> • <i>Africa Region "Findings" and "InfoBriefs" on Gender.</i> 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Country Contact Data Base in 5 groupings: WB staff at (1) HQ and(2) in country; In country contacts for (3)NGOs & Individuals and for (4) Government and University; and in (5)International Organizations. The latter 3 are each one list for all countries with one or more names for each country, but not very extensive for any country.</i> • <i>Country summary of Gender Findings. These are statistical profiles for each country comparing the country data with SSA averages for 8 parameters: GDP per capita, Primary school enrollment gap, Literacy gap for all adults, Representation of women in government, Percent of adequately nourished children, Life expectancy for adults, Access to improved water resources, and Adults living without HIV/AIDS.</i> • <i>Africa Region "Findings" and "Infobriefs" on Gender</i>
<i>Gender and Poverty</i>	<i>Clicks to the Poverty Net page</i>	<i>Nowhere on the first page is there reference to women or gender. The eight page summary of the Draft Poverty Evaluation Sourcebook (8pp) has one mention of women: "empowering poor men and women requires the removal of formal and informal institutional barriers..." In Chapter 2, "What is Empowerment?" women is mentioned 4 times in "men and women"; 5 times as a group of actors, usually in connection with a specific element of empowerment such as access to land, and 2 times in footnotes.</i>
<i>Gender and AIDS</i>		<i>Provides access to eleven documents and a link to the HIV/AIDS in Africa website. However, when clicked, it didn't work.</i>
<i>Gender and Economics</i>	<i>Provides access to seven articles</i>	<i>Articles include a piece on AGOA, four on gender and growth, and two on gender and international trade, all Bank documents</i>
<i>Gender and Law Program</i>	<i>Provides access to three publications and link to a map.</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Publications are: Access of women to legal and judicial services in Sub-Saharan Africa; the role of legal services organizations in attacking poverty; and Findings: Gender and law in Francophone in Sub-Saharan Africa.</i> • <i>A map of Africa shows where WB Gender and Law programs are being started.</i>
<i>Training and Learning</i>		<i>Provides a link to the Gender, Health, and Poverty: A Distance Learning Program</i>
<i>External Links</i>		<i>Provides links to a number of useful sites: African Development Bank (but when clicked, access was denied), Amnesty International, Women of Africa Resources (Colorado College Tuft Library), Web Resources on Women's Health (a long list of links), The Women in Development Network (WIDNET), Eld's Gateway, and Women's International League for Peace and Freedom.</i>
<i>Comments</i>	<i>Compared to the 2003 version, there seems to be more focused attention on separate issues or programs. The 10 country assessments are new and are tightly written and focused. The Country Summaries of Gender Findings which make visible some telling comparisons between the situation of women for each country relative to the mean for SSA is an interesting feature and new. On Gender and HIV/AIDS there is more focus on HIV/AIDS as a separate issue area. More emphasis is given to economics, and particularly trade, than before. The Gender and Law Program is given more emphasis and is more focused than in the earlier version. Digital Divide which was featured in 2003 is given less attention in the 2005 version. The Links to useful sites is much expanded from 2003.</i>	

LATIN AMERICA & THE CARIBBEAN GENDER SITE

<p><i>Note: This page has three distinct sections: (1) a list of areas covered; (2) News; and (3) Highlights. Also many of the documents are marked when available in Spanish</i></p>		
<p>(1) Gender: Areas Covered</p>	<p><i>This section is in the upper left hand corner of the page</i></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Overview: Has a short description of the World Bank program in LAC, gender development issues, the World Bank and LAC, and achievements in the promotion of gender equality with a number of points where readers can click to additional information</i> • <i>Events: one event announced (May 2004)</i> • <i>Our team: the headquarters based staff and their contact information</i> • <i>Publications: There are several under each of eight headings with immediate access to PDF versions: Country Gender Assessments (5), Education, Gender-based Violence, Health, Indigenous People, Labor and Micro-enterprise, Social Protection, and Good Practices in Mainstreaming Gender. At the bottom of the page one can click to "All publications" and/or "All informal publications"</i> • <i>Projects and Programs: 5 are listed each with a short description and in most cases links to additional information: Gender-based violence, Sex and reproductive health, Rural development, Public Sector management and reform, and Promoting Gender Equity</i> • <i>Data and Statistics: clicks to the Genderstats page</i> • <i>Related Links: Under each category lists a number of organizations with links to many of them—International Organizations, Regional Organizations, Statistical Agencies, National Women's Organizations (a click for each country), and NGOs listed by country with links for some of them.</i>
<p>(2) Stories, reports</p>	<p><i>This section takes the middle area of the page</i></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Gender in Focus: has a lead paragraph, in this case, Striking a Blow against Gender-based violence in Uruguay, which clicks to a longer story and then to appropriate additional information in that area</i> • <i>The World Bank and Gender in LAC: Story starts with HIV/AIDS and links to a summary of other WB programs in LAC with links to additional information</i> • <i>News: Headline links to the WB work on 'Improving Women's Health and Girls' Education are Key to Reducing Poverty</i> • <i>Regional News Archive</i>
<p>(3) Highlights</p>	<p><i>This is in a thin column to the right of the page</i></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>This provides links to descriptions or reports in several categories: Publications, Data and Statistics, Projects, and Additional Resources (repeat of Our Team and Related Links).</i> • <i>Publications: Subjects covered included: Mainstreaming Gender in Indigenous Projects in the World Bank portfolio (i.e. not just LAC), Addressing Gender-based violence in LAC (same as story featured in the middle), Gender impediments to economic development in the Mexican southern states, Mexico's PROGRESA Innovative targeting: gender focus and impact on social welfare</i> • <i>Data and statistics: LAC Gender Database (not available), About Data (tables on male and female labor force participation urban and rural), and Gender Stats.</i> • <i>Projects: Four listed with a click to additional ones</i>
<p>Comments</p>	<p><i>This site has added useful parts. There is an Overview piece that describes the WB program in LAC, gender development issues and achievements in the promotion of gender equality. There are a number of links to other sites for additional information. The Publications list is longer and sorted by topic. The Projects and Programs section is more focused on 5 topics with links. Related links section is expanded. In the earlier version, there was a section on analytic tools which is now absent, but is probably covered in the general gender page.</i></p>	

The Authors

Elaine Zuckerman, president and founder of the Washington-based non-profit Gender Action, worked inside the multilateral development banks (MDBs) for two decades. In the 1980s, Elaine created the first World Bank advocacy program to prevent the harmful impacts of structural adjustment loans on the poor, especially women. She served on the AWID Board of Directors during the 1980s. In the MDBs and as a consultant to bilateral aid agencies and civil society organizations such as the International Center for Research on Women and Oxfam, she worked in China, Latin America, Africa and Eastern Europe on gender, poverty, poverty reduction strategies, the social impact of macroeconomic policies and structural adjustment reforms, social investment funds, education and health financing and rural development and environment projects. Elaine studied in China for three years during the Cultural Revolution. She speaks and reads Chinese, French and Spanish.

Wu Qing is a leader of the Chinese women's movement. She is president of the China Women's Health Network, which was established in 1996 in Beijing, China and provides hotline counseling and free legal services to women throughout the country. CWHN also provides training in community building. She is also president of the Women's World Summit Foundation based in Geneva, Switzerland. In addition, she serves as an adviser of the *Rural Women Knowing All Magazine* published in China. She has been elected as People's Deputy to the Haidian District and Beijing Municipal People's Congresses in consecutive terms. In 2002, she was named Social Entrepreneur Winner of the Schwab Foundation for Social Entrepreneurship and in 2001 she was an Awardee of the Ramon Magsaysay Award for Public Service (nicknamed the Asian Nobel Prize). She serves on the board of Gender Action and is also the honorary chair of the Women's Intercultural Network.